

Taking Forward the *Right to the City*

Executive Summary - e-Debate 1 Report

The e-Debate on *Taking Forward the Right to the City* ran for four weeks in November/December 2009, the last of six on-line debates run UN-HABITAT in the run-up to the World Urban Forum 5 (WUF5) at Rio de Janeiro in March 2010. Building on an earlier UNESCO-UN-HABITAT project, the e-Debate provided an exciting opportunity for a global community of experts and internet users to explore the concept of the 'right to the city' (R2C), attracting 189 postings from 34 countries - from Argentina to Zambia.

- *Why the R2C?* - Week 1 asked why should a R2C exist, and what is its contribution in an urbanising world? Participants argued that the R2C draws on the UN's 1948 *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, but moves beyond a human rights agenda, to create a collective right where citizens are 'active agents of change'. The R2C is seen as a direct response to the profound inequalities and poverty in cities, both in rich and poor countries, and a platform to challenge the increasing commodification of urban assets.
- *What is the R2C?* - Week 2 focused on the content of the R2C, and how it should be framed. One approach advocated a broad swathe of political, economic and social rights, a second championed specific rights, to housing, clean water or an unpolluted environment. Some argued the need to legislate for a R2C, as in Brazil or Ecuador, whilst others proposed global or city charters as catalysts of change. City governments have a crucial in promoting the R2C, but can sometimes be obstructive. Evictions of slum communities or street traders were strongly opposed as undermining the R2C.
- *Whose R2C?* - Week 3 asked who are the right's bearers and what responsibilities does the R2C entail? Participants argued for a special focus in the R2C on women, children, city users, migrants and workers in the informal economy. Women face extreme discrimination in access to jobs and land, yet perform vital roles as carers, income earners and household heads. City users include commuters and visitors whose needs are often ignored, whilst migrants and informal economy workers do the low-paid jobs which make the city function, with little recognition. Children's rights are rarely addressed.
- *Taking forward the R2C* - Week 4 looked at how to implement the R2C, with a final flurry of posts and a plea for space for urban inhabitants at WUF5. The R2C was seen as a rallying cry for collective movements to challenge urban exclusion, with examples of grassroots women's academies, and a citizens' forum in India. From the Caribbean came a call to include cultural heritage in the R2C, and from Russia a challenge to the pervasive privatisation of urban space. Latin America provides inspiration in implementing the R2C - through national initiatives such as Brazil's 2001 *City Statute*, or local action such as wastepickers' *fora*. The final plea was to link the R2C agenda to the crucial issue of climate change.

Taking Forward the *Right to the City* Report on e-Debate 1

Wow! different people from different places with many different brilliant ideas, but one focus and goal. Herbert, Sierra Leone

1. Introduction

1.1 The e-Debate on *Taking Forward the Right to the City* was the last of six on-line debates commissioned by UN-HABITAT in the run-up to the World Urban Form 5 (WUF5) at Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, 22-26 March 2009. The final debate explored the core theme of the Forum; its objectives were to launch a global debate between the internet community and experts, to highlight critical issues, to enrich the agenda, and to guide implementation of the dialogue at WUF5.

1.2 The e-Debate lasted four weeks from 23.11.2009 to 19.12.2009. Four broad topics for the debate were agreed with UN-HABITAT, one for each week:

- Why the Right to the City?
- What is the Right to the City?
- Whose Right to the City?
- Taking Forward the Right to the City.

This report covers the four topics, and draws out themes emerging from the discussion. For simplicity the 'right to the city' is shortened to 'R2C' in the report.

1.3 The e-Debate attracted 189 postings from 59 contributors in 34 countries (see Appendix 1). There was strong representation from sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia, some contributions from Europe, North America, and Latin America, but limited participation from East Asia, Russia, the Middle East and North Africa, although translation was offered in the five UN languages and Portuguese.

1.4 As far as possible, the report draws on the words of individual contributors - participants in the e-Debate, invited experts and the moderating team. Participants are identified by the pseudonyms adopted for the debate, not their full names, and by their country - usually given as the country of residence rather than nationality. Quotes have been shortened where appropriate for readability.

2. Why the *Right to the City*?

Introducing the R2C

2.1 Week 1 of the e-Debate focussed on the topic 'Why the R2C?' - why should a right exist and what is its contribution in an urbanising world? The debate asked why - in the early 21st century - a reconceptualisation of rights is needed, what problems make it necessary and why a focus on cities is justified? This section gives a brief background to the concept of the R2C, before addressing these broader questions.

2.2 The concept of the R2C draws inspiration from two main sources. First, now that more than half the world's population lives in cities, many international campaigners are calling for a reappraisal of human rights to embrace the urban domain. The debate focuses on whether the 'human rights' agenda - mandated by the UN's 1948 *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, that created a global standard for all people and nations to liberty, justice and equality - should be extended to include political, economic, social, or environmental rights, for example access to shelter, or protection from climate change.

- 2.3 Second, the R2C, first articulated in the 1960s by the French sociologist, Henri Lefebvre, has inspired a rich academic debate (but no definite conclusion), creating a powerful paradigm in the struggle against the exclusion evident in globalised economies. Lefebvre's R2C had two main themes: it enfranchised citizens to *participate* in the use and production of urban space, and to *appropriate* the city - a right to full involvement in urban life¹. His call inspired a wealth of social action to strengthen the contract between cities and citizens, and a rich debate by leading academics such as David Harvey². Nevertheless, how to implement the concept remained vague.
- 2.4 Meanwhile, experience of articulating rights agendas was accumulating, for example through the adoption of the 1996 *Habitat Agenda*, through the groundbreaking 2001 *City Statute* in Brazil which reconceptualised the concept of urban land, and through similar initiatives elsewhere in Latin America. In 2005 UNESCO and UN-HABITAT launched a joint project on *Urban Policies and the Right to the City*³, which brought together experience and sought to develop consensus amongst key actors on public policy to take forward the R2C. The e-Debate takes forward this emerging agenda.

A Human Rights Dimension

- 2.5 Several participants referred back to the UN's *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* as the foundation of the R2C, for example two posts, one from UNESCO expert, **Brigitte Colin**⁴, and a second from the USA:

The right to the city, is a group of ethical values that all urban dwellers have to adhere to in order to promote new content for an urban social contract...The ethical values included in the concept are particularly relevant with regard to the UN's 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the more recent UNESCO conventions on the protection of cultural diversity and intangible heritage. Common values and considering the city public spaces as a common good are essential tracks to follow in the elaboration of new urban laws or a municipal charter to achieve the construction of more inclusive cities.
b_colin, Paris

International advocacy to the right to the city is justified by the UN's 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which gives citizens encompassing humanitarian rights that include human dignity, free speech...Among them are the guarantee of affordable shelter, freedom from living in pain (often brought on by poverty), and the right to eat...When government fails to create such opportunities, citizens have the freedom to challenge these failings and make demands from government. When this freedom is taken away, governments formulate citizens as mere subjects and not participatory agents in government. Camillemata, USA

- 2.6 Invited expert **Banashree Banerjee**⁵ argues that what distinguishes the R2C from the human rights agenda is the active engagement of citizens:

The paradigm of the right to the city is based on the universally accepted concept of human rights, but it cannot be seen to be part of the human rights regime. The critical

¹ Lefebvre, H. (1996) *Right to the City*, English translation of 1968 text in Kofman, E. and Lebas, E. (eds and translators) *Writings on Cities*, Oxford, Blackwell Publishing

² Harvey, D. (2008) Right to the city, *New Left Review*, 53: September-October 2008: pp23-40

³ Brown, A. and Kristiansen, A. (2008) *Urban Policies and the Right to the City: Rights, responsibilities and citizenship*, Paris, UNESCO, <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0017/001780/178090e.pdf>

⁴ Brigitte Colin is an expert in Architecture and the City and International Migrations and Multiculturalism, in the Social and Human Sciences sector of UNESCO, who managed the UNESCO UN-HABITAT project on *Urban Policies and the Right to the City: Rights, responsibilities and citizenship*.

⁵ Banashree Banerjee is an independent development consultant, urban planner, and lecturer at the IHS in Rotterdam, the Netherlands. Among many international commissions, she was an assessor for the UN-Habitat Best Practices Awards 2008, and a member of the Global Commission for Legal Empowerment of the Poor, 2007.

difference is that the right to the city can be effective only when city dwellers become, and continue to be, active agents of change rather than recipients of dispensed benefits. This is the common thread that runs through the development of thinking on the concept from when it was first articulated by Henri Lefebvre in the 1960s.

The implication is that development decisions about the city are not confined to the city hall but are the result of debate and deliberation among the citizens. Claims and negotiations around the use of public space in the city acquire particular significance, given the regime of private property rights in most cultures....The other issue of importance is that of equity and priority in the access to civic services and right to housing, health care etc. Banashree Banarjee, India

Poverty, Exclusion

- 2.7 Many contributors argue for a R2C as a response to the increasing urbanisation of poverty:

The right to the city is a fundamental human right....premised on the recognition that there is a close nexus between economic, social, cultural and environmental wellbeing....Urbanization comes with a lot of challenges such as poverty, social exclusion, environmental degradation, transport nightmares, crumbling infrastructure, poor housing coupled with sprouting of informal settlements, and incessant conflicts. AGGERY KERE, Kenya

When urbanization is profoundly marked by great inequality in economic conditions of the people of a city, urban amenities are likely to be created and consumed by the privileged minority. Various minority social groups - ethnic, linguistic, religious, and the weak the old, the disabled - can be the sufferers....We find luxury apartments surrounded by inhuman slums, utterly inadequate public open space, inefficient public transport, and lack of basic amenities....Instead of making the cities the cradles of creative endeavours,....confluences of cultures, and organs of progress, the absence of the right to the city makes them areas of continuous conflicts, tumult and terror. Let's have the right to the city and be responsible citizens in return. sbonnerjee India

- 2.8 Even in rich countries, the disadvantaged cannot always access urban resources, as this post from Australia demonstrates:

With an overwhelming tendency for many authorities and governments to view development through a largely economic lens our cities have become increasingly stratified. The gap between the 'haves' and 'have nots' widens as prosperity increases because the power and influence within cities typically belongs to those with the means and resources to influence political processes or to bypass them. This occurs, I believe, not only within developing countries but also in developed countries. In an age of declining global energy security, water scarcity, declining food security ...(etc) it is the poor and socially marginalised within cities who will suffer the most.... MJ, Australia

A Focus on Cities?

- 2.9 Several arguments were put forward to justify a focus on cities. First modern cities have very fluid populations, many of whom are not formally defined as 'citizens' or 'urban residents', for example the influx of daily commuters in modern cities (Maseland, Kenya), temporary or guest workers, and migrants without formal papers (Tanja, UK). Many cities depend on temporary workers to run essential services, who contribute to the 'public good' of cities but have limited access to resources.
- 2.10 Second, contributors saw the R2C as a necessary antidote to the commodification of urban land. David Harvey⁶ has argued that there is an intimate connection between

⁶ Harvey, D. (2008) Right to the city, *New Left Review*, 53: September-October 2008: pp23-40

capitalism and urbanisation as a process that is inherently exclusionary, since capital surpluses are controlled by a few, leading to the increasing marginalisation of poor populations. An example is the pressure to redevelop low-income city centre neighbourhoods, such as Dharavi in Mumbai or Kampung Baru in Kuala Lumpur, to capitalise valuable city centre land, or the devastating clearance of central market areas. This view was reflected by several participants, for example:

Our cities have been commodified. Land, services and all aspects of the city have a price label or an economic value attached to them. Access to the city and its benefits therefore introduces an economic and legal inequality. Those who can afford it can make the city work for them, while those who cannot will find the city an environment with daily struggles for survival.... Maseland, Kenya

The "freedom to make and remake our cities" (argued by David Harvey)...is much more than just a right to visit or stay in the city. It inevitably challenges the right of property as the basic legal framework for urban redevelopment. Second is the proposal of "a common rather than an individual right": This argument inevitably challenges the idea of the individual as foundation for legal rights and property. Jan Roters, Germany

- 2.11 In contrast, some argued that the R2C should be developed to recognize the close linkages that exist between cities and rural areas:

I am apprehensive and hesitant about this Right, as it very much reflects the general emphasis on helping the poor urban settlers, at the expense of giving emphasis on strengthening the rural communities...what is becoming critical is not the spatial character nor the exercise of residing in the city....but the issue of providing the quality and character of life - the right of people to live with dignity and equally enjoy the benefits and amenities of urban living. JNBona, Philippines

The Right to the City ought to be considered in terms of ownership or mutual belonging....manifested in symbiotic, equitable relationships between the city and its rural hinterland at individual and communal levels....That sub-Saharan African cities do not give these rights so easily for the large majority of their population is partly due to their nature as predators on rural areas. kariuki, Kenya

A Universal R2C?

- 2.12 Participants debated whether it is possible to agree a universal definition of the R2C. Some argued that 'rights' - eg: to safety, security, or adequate shelter - should be universal, but 'needs' are more acute where there are concentrations of poverty and exclusion - hence the focus on 'the city'. For example:

The R2C...is a universal right and must be treated as such, holding unto the fact that we all have equal responsibilities to make this world a better place where everyone can live in peace and have respect for human dignity and nature. Herbert, Sierra Leone

- 2.13 Some such as Jim Elliot and WU Fulong emphasised the collective and fundamental nature of the R2C:

The Right to the City brings to my mind a number of fundamental truths...first is the Socratic oath of physicians, "do no harm". This means to others... other life forms..(or) systems like water, air, land. Then as people gather in groups in towns, villages and the city, there are rights that begin to flow from the group. The individual still must have access to those commons, air, land and water for basic sustenance....Then, collectively we need to be able to use the group to define our way of life and how we will treat ourselves and other. Jim Elliot, Canada

- 2.14 patgreen of Jamaica and Nezar of Egypt expressed reservations about defining universal principles:

It would be difficult to develop a "universal definition"...as I believe that politics and culture preclude universality. Nonetheless, I believe that there may be

“universal solutions” that may be implemented within national socio-political frameworks....Yes, common “universal solutions” are possible, not only within the LAC region but also for all other regions globally that all share poverty, squatting, illegal vending, etc, requiring resolutions for the R2C of the marginalized (rich and poor). patgreen, Jamaica

2.15 There were also doubters about how the R2C will be defined and operate, for example:

1. *What would be excluded from the Right to the City (because that is easier than to think of what to include! So much to include...)*
2. *Responsibilities for implementation....I am not clear on how radical the nature of the Right to the City is - (does it envision that) existing governments and hierarchies of power will provide this right,...non-governmental actors will step (in), or....more radically - see an entirely new role for the individual?*
3. *Why is it even necessary to provide a Right to the City? Haven't most governments already adopted charters and signed onto human rights treaties? LeoV, USA*

The very use of the term 'right' is problematic to start with and perhaps at the core of the long and thus far quite unresolved debate given the legal connotations attached to the term 'right'. Maseland, Kenya

Why the R2C? - Summary of Views

- 2.16 In summary, many participants agreed that the R2C draws on the well-founded platform of the UN's 1948 *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, but moves beyond the human rights agenda. First, the R2C is seen as a collective right, rather than a collection of specific rights. Second, the R2C can only be effective when citizens become involved as 'active agents of change', influencing decisions about city development, the use of public space and private property regimes.
- 2.17 The reappraisal of human rights inherent in the R2C is necessitated by the increasing urbanisation of poverty and institutional discrimination against minority social groups, which makes cities 'arenas of conflict' instead of 'cradles of creative endeavour'. That such disadvantage exists in both developed and developing countries was an argument cogently made by several contributors.
- 2.18 The focus on cities was justified by arguments that modern cities have fluid populations, many not formally defined as citizens whose rights are often ignored, for example commuters, guest workers or migrants. Contributors argued that the R2C is a necessary platform to challenge the commodification of urban land and assets, and the accompanying exclusionary processes which marginalise the poor.
- 2.19 The debate about the universality of principles underlying the R2C was inconclusive, and some also argued that rights should not be exclusive to urban populations but should extend to rural communities. Despite the doubts, the general consensus was that the R2C agenda is a forceful response to the marketisation of urban assets, which can empower citizens and champion struggles against exclusion evident in many modern cities.

3. What is the *Right to the City*?

Who and How?

- 3.1 Drawing from experience to date, Week 2 of the e-Debate focussed on the content of the R2C, what it should include (or exclude), and how it should be framed. The debate considered the need for a legislative foundation to the R2C, the role of non-binding charters as a policy framework, and the role of government - particularly local authorities - in implementing a R2C agenda. Discussion also touched on the role of taxation as a marker of citizenship, problems of corruption and resettlement, and particular challenges in post-conflict societies and repressive regimes. Key debates are summarised below.

Content of the R2C

- 3.2 In discussing the specific attributes of the R2C, two approaches were common - the inclusion of environmental, political and social rights, and rights to access specific services (eg: housing, infrastructure, economic, social and cultural rights). In a long and thoughtful post, **sbonnerjee** suggested that rights can be broadly classified into eight main categories, summarised as follows:

- *Environmental*: clean air, natural light, absence of pollution;
- *Housing*: the opportunity to procure suitable accommodation;
- *Infrastructure*: water supply, sewage and waste disposal, power, or transport;
- *Economic*: freedom to own/rent land, pursue economic activities, and claim to compensation for displacement;
- *Social*: freedom of movement, and access to urban facilities;
- *Cultural*: access to cultural or recreational facilities, and freedom of religion;
- *Political*: right to participate in shaping one's environment and governance;
- *Safety & Security*: safety from violence.

It is absolutely necessary that these operate within a frame work of planning legislation and be within the purview of a judicial system. sbonnerjee India

- 3.3 The following post from Canada takes a similarly broad approach:

A right to the city should include overarching principles drawn from existing internationally protected unqualified rights...including the right to: housing; universally accessible not-for-profit health care; clean air; education; safe drinking water; sewage treatment; organicfood - free from pesticides and free from genetically modified organisms; civil and political rights; freedom from discrimination;...public transportation and labour rights; to socially acceptable environmentally safe and sound employment, energy, right to peace etc. JoanRussow, Canada

- 3.4 Others focussed more on the R2C as a specific right to housing, services or other urban resources:

Normally poor people have to suffer a lot, because they come to the city to get a job, and search for shelter to stay. A space to live is our basic rights, but they do not get it. Quazi, Bangladesh

People have access to the basic needs such as water, shelter, electricity, health facilities, security of tenure, food, etc. The Right to the City protects many people especially poor urban dwellers living in slums and low income residents from being evicted. It is also about freedom of expression of urban residents. They all need to take part into the development of their city by giving their opinions and ideas. Thierry Ngoga, Rwanda

Therefore the concept 'right to city' is interpreted in the context of the right to enter, right to live and right to access to the city's resources. NN Sastry India

- 3.5 Some argued convincingly that the need for shelter occurs in developed countries as well as in developing nations:

Here in Toronto we are in desperate need of finding solutions to income assistance and homelessness....Every person that lives here should have the opportunity to have food, clothing, shelter, and water. With the current rates and the cost of living we are breeding poverty into our next generation....Be innovative and creative to different approaches. redz1976, Canada

An issue....in Australian cities is closely linked to housing affordability. Many workers in essential services (eg: police, fire, ambulance, nurses, social workers) are finding it difficult to access housing both close to city centres and within greater metropolitan areas. Many....on low to moderate incomes are now forced to reside in fringe....areas where access to public transport, hospitals, universities, recreation and employment is inadequate....The poor have to spend more money to access services, money that most do not have, because a good part of their income is spent on housing. MJ Australia

- 3.6 Bwalya identified three types of segregation in Zambian cities, arguing that all inhabitants should have equal access to the benefits of land acquisition, natural resources, utilities, education, environment, shelter, infrastructure and services.

1. *Cities in Zambia were conceived and born as a result of colonisation. Urbanisation was segregated on racial lines....*
2. *Upon independence the restrictions to the urban areas were removed....sadly a new type of segregation developed....based on class distinctions. The planning laws which are in existence today do not address the needs of the urban poor....*
3. *A new type of segregation was born in the 90s... based on political affiliations - the seed was sown when in a presidential campaign the president decreed that all sitting tenants be sold their houses....The president went ahead and won the election.*

In conclusion I would say the leadership in the country has a duty to nurture our cities and champion the fight in securing that all inhabitants are accorded rights to the city without any form of segregation. Bwalya, Zambia

Law and the R2C

- 3.7 The legal regimes that underpin processes of urbanization have been widely debated in recent years. The Commission for Legal Empowerment of the Poor, reporting in 2008, argued that four billion people around the world lack the protection and rights afforded by the law. Moreover, the Commission recognized that individual property rights could have a negative impact on security of tenure, particularly for the urban poor.⁷ Leading academic, Patrick McAuslan, has argued that whilst inappropriate legislation turns ‘homesteaders into squatters’ and ‘petty traders into criminals’, nevertheless ‘governance in accordance with the law is likely to be fairer, more respected, more effective in the long run than governance in defiance or in disregard of the law; both at the local level of urban planning and at higher levels of governance’⁸. Participants in the e-Debate took up several of these themes.
- 3.8 Invited expert Edésio Fernandes⁹ argued that the exclusionary nature of urban development is often based on inappropriate legislation. The R2C can only be tackled, therefore, through effective reform of the legal order that underpins the development of cities.

⁷ UNDP (2008) Making the Law work for Everyone: Report of the Commission for Legal Empowerment of the Poor, Volume 1, <http://www.undp.org/legalempowerment/library.shtml>

⁸ McAuslan, P. (2004) ‘In the beginning was the law..an intellectual odyssey’, The Practice of Law and Development - Socio-Legal Approaches, Cornell Law Library, http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1008&context=ealccs_pld

⁹ Edésio Fernandes is a jurist and urban planner; a member of DPU Associates, the Teaching Faculty of the Lincoln Institute of Land Policy and UN-HABITAT’s Advisory Group on Forced Evictions

Since it was coined in the late 1960s by French philosopher and sociologist Henri Lefebvre (1901-1991), the concept of the "right to the city" has inspired renewed theoretical discussion and several forms of socio-political action, initially in Latin America and more recently in other regions....The "right to the city" would consist of the right of all city dwellers to fully enjoy urban life with all of its services and advantages - the right to habitation - as well as taking direct part in the management of cities - the right to participation.

Revealing and exciting as his ideas are, Lefebvre's concept of the "right to the city".... did not directly explore how, or the extent to which, the legal order has determined the exclusionary pattern of urban development....The reform of the legal order is one of the main conditions for changing the exclusionary nature of urban development, and for confronting the phenomenon of informal urban development.

In Brazil and in several Latin American countries, academics, politicians, urban managers, urban social movements and NGOs have gradually understood that....urban reform....in the region....(necessitates) a profound legal-political reform that affirms.... the socio-environmental function of property and a new set of citizenship rights....Since the 1970s, consistent attempts have been made in countries such as Brazil and Colombia to materialise the concept of the right to the city....The approval of Law no. 388/1997, in Colombia, and especially the 2001 City Statute in Brazil, are very significant developments in this process. Edésio Fernandes

- 3.9 Several participants echoed the importance of the legislative basis for the R2C, for example this posting from the Philippines:

In taking forward the right to the city, programmes and policies must be legislated to give a legal mandate on this issue. In the Philippines, we have many laws that protect the rights of women like the Anti-Violence Against Women and Children Act, the Single Parent Act and other significant legal milestones. As a signatory of CEDAW, CRC, and UNDHR¹⁰, the Philippines has been a good example of advancing the causes of women and children. SlimBoyFat, Philippines

Role of Charters and Declarations

- 3.10 Charters and declarations were seen as another valuable route to enshrining the R2C. Eva Garcia Chueca¹¹ of Spain writes of the work of the organisation United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG), which is advocating two tools to promote social inclusion and participatory democracy, *World-Charter Agenda on Human Rights in the City* and the *European Charter on Human Rights in the City*¹². She writes:

....local authorities, as the sphere of government closest to citizens, are key agents in the realisation of Human Rights. The materialisation of Human Rights in the urban territory and of the Right to the City demands new local policies. In UCLG we are trying (i) to engage local governments worldwide to mainstream Human Rights in municipal administration and (ii) to create worldwide discussion fora with local governments aimed at defining these new local policies to take forward the right to the city. This is not an easy or short path. Much effort and work is needed and the participation of all urban stakeholders is, without any doubt, required. But the process has already started and we cannot pull out. Eva Garcia Chueca, Spain.

- 3.11 Another example of charters was provided by **WomenInCitiesItI**, a global exchange network seeking to raise awareness of gender equality and the place of women in cities, including women's access to local governance and safety and security. They wrote of their experience with three charters aimed at strengthening rights:

¹⁰ CEDAW (1979 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women), CRC (UNICEF 1989 Convention on the Rights of the Child) UNDHR (1948 United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights)

¹¹ Eva Garcia Chueca, Executive Secretary, Committee on Social Inclusion and Participatory Democracy, UCLG

¹² More information about the charters being promoted by UCLG is available at:
www.cities-localgovernments.org/cisdg

- the *Montreal Declaration on Women's Safety*¹³ developed in 2002 at the first International Seminar on Women's Safety, that seeks to link the creation of safer cities for women with the enforcement of women's rights to the city, appealing to *all* relevant actors for support;
- the *Declaration of Bogota: Safe Cities for Women and Girls*¹⁴ agreed in 2004, at the second International Conference on Safe Cities for Women and Girls;
- the *Montreal Charter of Rights and Responsibilities*¹⁵, in which women's rights to the city (including rights to personal safety) are mainstreamed. The charter is upheld by an ombudsman.

As the participant from WomenInCitiesIntl said:

The effect of these declarations cannot be measured per se. However, since their institution, international work on women's safety as a gateway to women's rights to the city has progressed enormously and continues to grow, including valuable work in Montreal and in Bogota.... Currently, a third International Conference on Women's Safety is being planned in November 2010 in Delhi, India.... WomenInCitiesIntl, Canada

- 3.12 There are difficulties too in implementing charters. Liz Branigan from Australia writes of the experience in the State of Victoria with the *Victorian Charter of Human Rights and Responsibilities Act*, passed in 2006, which theoretically protects the R2C for all. However in autumn 2009, the *Summary Offences and Control of Weapons Acts Amendments Bill* was passed which appears to breach the rights of freedom of association and expression in the charter. She wrote:

Police have increased powers to search any person in a designated area, even when there is no reasonable suspicion the person is carrying a weapon....Police may also conduct pre-arrest strip searches of anyone in certain circumstances and move people on whenever an officer believes the person is likely to 'breach the peace' or 'endanger the safety of other persons'. Such powers....(may) be applied in a discriminatory and disproportionate way against vulnerable community members, including the homeless, young people, Aboriginal people, or people with mental health issues.

The Government admits this new power breaches the Charter, and the Victorian Privacy Commissioner has expressed concern....So, what good is the right to the city if the government does not take the responsibility to ensure this can be enjoyed by all, especially its most marginalised and vulnerable citizens? Liz Branigan, Australia

Governance, Participation and the Role of **City** Governments

- 3.13 Good governance was seen by many participants as an essential context for implementing the R2C, with a corresponding need for transparency and citizen participation in processes of change. The R2C was seen, however, as being a broader concept, as indicated by invited expert Banashree Banerjee, and architect kariuki, Kenya.

The right to the city has been seen as a way of reducing poverty, social exclusion and urban violence as well as fostering good governance. Seen from that perspective, it overlaps with the concept of the 'inclusive city', which also seeks to draw on participatory governance, inclusive planning and service deliveryBut the inclusive

¹³ Montreal Declaration on Women's Safety,
http://www.womenincities.org/seminar/english/set_declaration.htm (English);
http://www.womenincities.org/seminar/espagnol/set_declaration.htm (Spanish)
http://www.womenincities.org/seminar/francais/set_intro_fr.htm (French)

¹⁴ Declaration of Bogota: Safe Cities for Women and Girls
http://ww2.unhabitat.org/programmes/safercities/documents/Declaration_of_Bogota.pdf (English)
http://ww2.unhabitat.org/programmes/safercities/documents/Declaration_of_BogotaSP.pdf (Spanish).

¹⁵ Montreal Charter of Rights and Responsibilities
http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/pls/portal/docs/page/charte_mtl_en/media/documents/charte_droits_en.pdf English
http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/pls/portal/docs/page/charte_mtl_fr/media/documents/charte_droits_fr.pdf French

city does not seem to have the intensely participatory, activist and empowering connotation that the right to the city provokes. The right to the city is also more complex as it may lead to conflicts born out of diverse claims as well as political and economic empowerment related to specific rights.

In that sense the five crucial instrumental freedoms - economic opportunity, political freedoms, social facilities, transparency guarantees, and protective security- elaborated by Amartya Sen¹⁶....culd easily be seen as the touchstones of the right to the city Banashree Banerjee, India

Good governance should be considered the umbrella of basic human rights because it enables people to organize sustainable use of available social, economic, environmental and spiritual resources under which....individual rights such as water, housing, education, movement, free speech, assembly and others can be attained. At some point soon, access to broadband may become a part of the right of association....Good governance should be internationally enforced at the level of war crimes, money laundering and drug trade. The wastage of a million lives is almost the same as taking them away. kariuki, Kenya

- 3.14 It was perhaps disappointing that there was little substantive discussion in the debate on the role of municipal governments in promoting the R2C, nor examples of good practice by enlightened administrations widening the inclusion of marginalised groups and extending rights. The following post however argued for a major policy shift in municipal agendas:

One of the exciting potentials of the right to the city is to counter the barriers posed by the traditions of municipal government. Municipal governments have been largely preoccupied with issues of wealth creation for property owners, and speculation around property ownership....The right to the city serves to empower citizens, particularly marginalized groups, to think of having the right to demand services, and organize collectively to make the demands....So the right to the city is an idea of empowerment, of thinking that one has the right to a city as a safe, inclusive place to live. In this way the right to the city is a tool for public education and citizen awareness, particularly in working with marginalized groups such as women, the young and the elderly, the poor and the recent newcomers to the city. Caroline Andrew, Canada

Taxation and Urban Rights

- 3.15 A lively debate took place between those who consider that the R2C should be enjoyed mainly by those who pay taxes, and those who argue for a wider constituency of citizenship, as these three views demonstrate.

It is a fact that most city residents (particularly the poor) want to enjoy adequate services, utilities and facilities from the city, but they don't want to contribute towards building the city by paying tax and when due. For the city to be sustainable, payment of taxes is the qualification for adequate services and utilities....City residents must understand that there is no free lunch in the city. Abubakar Sadiq Sani, Nigeria

Those who pay taxes, rates and other city levies make the functioning of the city possible. At face value, they would, through their financial contributions, have purchased the 'right' to enjoy the urban benefits. In other words, we have created urban settings as the playground for those who can afford it and that are, by definition, inherently exclusionary for those who cannot. It is a matter of one's political philosophy whether the urban poor who do not pay towards the costs of running the city are viewed as a parasitic group or as socially excluded victims of the very legal and economic manner in which our cities are organized. Maseland, Kenya

While it can be argued that the urban poor do not contribute directly to municipal funding of public goods through taxation, most cities with large numbers of poor people benefit from a low wage economy, that - as in China or India - provides cheap labour to

¹⁶ Sen, A. (2001) *Development as Freedom*, Oxford and New York, Oxford University Press

support urban development. Furthermore, the urban poor often can, and do, pay heavily for basic urban services, and contribute to municipal funds...in my view, the 'right to the city' indicates - not a right to specific services - but a collective right to transparent allocation of the public goods and resources that exist, with an emphasis on basic services. Alison, UK

Evictions and the R2C

- 3.16 Several participants wrote of the traumatic impact of evictions on those affected, and lack of recognition of the social capital networks and non-market systems of exchange on which many of the poor depend.

It leaves me in shock when I see poor people being forcefully evicted from the city, and forced to relocate to far places out the city with no good services like good roads, schools, electricity, water etc. Surprisingly this is done by the rich and mostly government bosses and this has made the rich become more richer at the expense of the poor....Our governments should realise this right to the city and right of everyone to an urban life. Bwomezi, Uganda

A Yaoundé aujourd'hui, les casses et déguerpissements sont devenus quasi systématiques traduisant l'exclusion de certains aux privilèges urbains. Sinon comment justifier qu'à la suite de ces déguerpissements et casses, il n'y ait pas de mesures pragmatiques de compensation. (Translation: In Yaoundé today, evictions have become a symbol of systematic exclusion of some people from urban privileges. At the end of such evictions there is no compensation). Minfegue, Cameroon

- 3.17 Irene Karanja, from a Kenyan NGO the Pamoja Trust, wrote of the demolition of an informal market in Nairobi affecting 292 traders.

Not too long ago an informal market called Aoko Road Market in Nairobi's South B middle class residential estate was brought down by the council's bulldozer at midnight. The Market is a natural emergence because it lies on the road that leads to one of Nairobi's largest block of slums called " The Mukuru Belt" and it also serves a large middle class neighbourhood ...The traders had invested a lot of time and trust in the council requesting permission to trade as the road was being rehabilitated. Unfortunately the eviction still happened....

The eviction came with its consequences such as arrest, trial and cash bail for the traders, complete destruction of trading stock and business structures....Our urban poor are competing with the national economic market....(and) if we continue to deprive them of their contribution to the economy and quiet enjoyment of the public resources, we may be institutionalizing violence....Slum settlements form faster than the urban planning experts in Government can keep up. The challenge on their part is to deal with a problem by making informal settlements or informal markets special planning areas. Eviction is not a solution or a remedy....

In Aoko Road informal market....the traders have paid close to US\$ 800,000 to the city council for the period of time they have traded, (but) there is still no difference with those that do not pay those "taxes". NO services or protection are granted to them by the state. Irene Karanja, Kenya

Impacts of Corruption and Conflict on the R2C

- 3.18 The avoidance of corruption and discrimination was a theme raised by several participants, emphasising its negative impact on citizens. Others emphasized the challenges of realizing the R2C in post-conflict societies.

Due to corruption here in Uganda, the little money which people pay as their contribution to the government for these services has been mismanaged and diverted to personal business by those who should be in charge of planning and provision of these named services. This has left the city prone to accidents due to roads full of potholes, inadequate clean water, poor housing, unemployment etc. Bwomezi Uganda

Think of hundreds of thousands of private businessmen and government personnel involved in the system of government revenue cheating (taxes, permits, licensing, quotas etc.) either legitimate or illegitimate. Because of scarcity of appropriate manpower, this problem is almost impossible to solve in reality. In the Philippines, stealing from government coffers as reported in July 1999 amounts to roughly US\$940m annually which translates to about 20% of the national budget. JNBona Philippines

- 3.19 The challenges of post-conflict societies and impacts on urban development were also highlighted, although often people in contexts of civil strife move to cities because they have no choice and there are few economic opportunities in the areas they leave behind. These posts from Sierra Leone and Nepal illustrate some of the challenges:

Sierra Leone for instance has since the end of the war experienced a very high growth in the population of...the capital city Freetown. The result of this growth has led us to experience a high rate in violent and criminal activities, land grabbing and unlawful construction of buildings in reserve areas (cutting down trees, burning bushes and wood for coal, drying up streams etc.) Some of the negative experience the city has faced in the recent past in relation to climate change can be attributed to some of these activities. Herbert, Sierra Leone

I have been observing the scenario of our post conflict society in Nepal. Population growth in the capital city Kathmandu is very high. All kinds of people live in squatter settlements, slums, and...rich and poor can be seen clearly separated in terms of settlement. Land costs increased and land became like a share value. Poor people cannot think about purchasing land for housing. Namraj, Nepal

Political Challenges to the R2C

- 3.20 In some countries, the R2C is perceived as a luxury that people cannot access. As a Malaysian invitee said: "We don't have time to think about this type of concept, because the pace of development is too fast here". Rights are a sensitive topic in some contexts, as these posts from Egypt and Russia point out:

In countries with autocratic regimes and cities without policy making power like the case in many countries of the MENA region, the right to the city is a daily concern of urban dwellers and migrants....To them, right to the city is about the right to find a job, to earn a living, to have access to officials controlling their lives, to voice a concern and to be heard...and to have hope in the future. In many cities around the MENA region, citizens are deprived of these very basic rights. City mayors are appointed by a phone call....Their term in office is also terminated by a phone call. Such mayors do whatever they can to please the political masters without any concern to citizens....To influence the status quo will require governance reform, and investment in strengthening....civil society entities to lobby for citizens' right to the city. Osama, Egypt

The experience of the post-socialist city shows that the urban communities can be affected by lack of political engagement, indifference and general apathy....In a post-socialist society this can be a result of several circumstances: 1) general distrust towards any communitarian action as a reaction to decades of the Communist party rule;....2) lack of experience and lack of democratic tradition; 3) high proportion of the first generation migrants to the city;....4) the desire of the political elites to keep public interest in politics low by suppressing the opposition, imposing government control on the media and manipulation of electoral results. The 'right to the city' is an elusive concept. Nadir Kinossian, Russia

What is the R2C? Summary of Views

- 3.21 This was a substantive part of the e-Debate, that first explored the content of the R2C. Two approaches were adopted to elaborating the R2C - the first identifying a broad umbrella of political, environmental, and social rights within a strong judicial

system, and the second focussing on specific rights, e.g. to shelter or clean water. Participants reiterated that poor access to housing occurs in both developed and developing countries.

- 3.22 The legal context for the R2C was seen as crucial. As expert Edésio Fernandes argued, reform of the legal order is one of the main conditions for changing the exclusionary nature of urban development. Examples of changes to the constitution in Brazil and Colombia which explicitly recognise a R2C provide an exciting precedent. The necessity of legal reform was supported by several participants.
- 3.23 The potential of international, national or city charters for mainstreaming a rights agenda was raised by the international organisation United Cities and Local Governments which promotes social inclusion and participatory democracy, and Women In Cities International which focuses on gender equality and women's security. A cautionary note came from Victoria, Australia, where the State's human rights charter is providing no protection against increased police control.
- 3.24 Many argued for the need for good governance, for political freedoms and transparency in service provision, although few examples were given of municipal programmes promoting a rights agenda. There were considerable differences in relation to taxation and urban rights - some argued that only those who pay taxes should benefit from the R2C, whilst others said that the urban poor may pay for urban services through informal means.
- 3.25 A discussion of the traumatic impact of evictions on the urban poor and the need to find negotiated solutions within an R2C agenda was illustrated by a case study of clearances at the Aoko Road Market in Nairobi, where payment of fees did not protect traders. Finally, the debate touched on the challenges of strengthening rights in a context of corruption and/or in post-conflict societies. The difficulties of promoting a rights agenda in countries in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) and in former socialist countries were also highlighted.

4. *Whose Right to the City?*

Rights-Bearers and Champions

- 4.1 Week 3 of the debate addressed the issue of 'Whose R2C?', asking: 'Who are the rights-bearers? Who should champion the R2C?' and 'What are the responsibilities of citizenship?' In cities throughout the world many people suffer exclusion from the full benefits of urban life. Discussion in this e-Debate focused on the R2C for women, children, city users, migrants and workers in the informal economy; needs of the handicapped and elderly were also mentioned briefly. Women, for example, may suffer unequal access to land or urban services, or discrimination at work. Migrants may lack formal papers but form a key part of the urban workforce, while ethnic minorities may face religious or other discrimination. Posts on these issues are presented below.

Women's R2C

- 4.2 A particularly vocal theme of the e-Debate was the call for explicit recognition of women's R2C. Participants argued that the R2C should have a strong gender dimension as women face particular forms of discrimination in cities. Professor

Jacqueline Leavitt¹⁷ argues that the 'right to the city' is a lens to ensure that women's voices are heard.

The right to the city is not gender neutral...Women have been crying out and demanding much of what is embedded in the phrase the 'right to the city' for a very long time. In their everyday lives, this translates into struggles for affordable housing; options for responsible child care facilities; alternative methods of transportation; accessible services, and safety...Poor and working class women, women of colour and women earning low wages have to venture out and creatively negotiate the use of public space. At the same time women are held responsible for household work and care of children. Across the globe, women's circumstances in city and rural areas, is inherently harder because they receive lower wages, lack ownership or control of land, and are less represented in governance structures. This combination leaves women powerless. In countries where ownership of land is linked to livelihoods, powerlessness is equivalent to assigning women to lifelong poverty. Jacqueline Leavitt

- 4.3 Participants vividly highlighted the discrimination, violence and injustice faced by women in cities:

Discrimination, threat of physical or sexual assault, economic insecurity, and many other forms of violence against women force them to live within very real constraints. These constraints are reinforced in the very fabric of cities, from their physical structure to their governing processes...From urban planning to economic policy and service provision, we must consider our communities as enablers or barriers on the road to human dignity and equality...Within illegal settlements, grassroots women are hardly "parasites"...These women raise families, work in poorly paid jobs that sustain the larger economy, and organize themselves politically to secure legal land tenure and better futures for themselves and their children...At the same time, these women are forced to work within a political and physical framework that threatens the security and health of their person and their family. This is not a sentimental view, but rather the reality of women on the ground around the world who do not share the right to the city. WomeninCitiesIntl, Canada

- 4.4 As Birte, a campaign coordinator with the Huairou Commission¹⁸, said:

Women make up the majority of urban dwellers, in particular slum dwellers. It has been estimated that (the proportion of women in) urban slum populations ranges from 55-70 per cent. These are single women (or sometimes married) women who head households, widows, often disinherited from rural areas and forced into slums, young girls, women with children, grandmothers, often caring for orphans, etc. There are many women, with specific issues and specific needs and roles...Women are a major part of the city - recognition of their vital roles as carers, income generators, household heads, community developers, and adequate attention their specific needs, which are complex due to the discrimination they face, must be an integrated part of the right to the city. The right to the city must take into account grassroots women's realities. Birte, USA

- 4.5 SlimBoyFat gave examples of several initiatives to support women and children in the Philippines: shelters and a haven for abused women and children, livelihood projects to support independence, and a desk for women at the local police stations. A Supreme Court ruling provides for the establishment of family-friendly courts, and national policy requires cities to allocate 5 percent of their Internal Revenue Allotment budget to gender issues. sbonnerjee argued that R2C should be available to all underprivileged and minority groups - linguistic, religious or ethnic,

¹⁷ Jacqueline Leavitt, Professor of Urban Planning at UCLA, Los Angeles, and housing and public policy expert. Since 1999, she has been working closely with the Huairou Commission, an international network of grassroots women's organisations (see Section 4.2 below)

¹⁸ Huairou Commission (HC) is a global coalition comprised of global and regional networks and grassroots women's organizations, that share a commitment to strategically support grassroots women to expand their participation and leadership in community development, human settlements and public decision making in order to achieve gender equitable, pro-poor policies and investments.

and that women's rights should also be protected. He gave the example of the special facilities for women on public transport in India as measures of protection - Ladies' Special Trains and seats in public buses.

Young People in the City

- 4.6 The needs of children and young people were mentioned by many participants and several made this a specific focus of their input, particularly African youth workers Minfegue from Cameroon, and ddunguadrian from Uganda.

Participation of young people is poor in the construction of our cities, but they represent over 50% of our population, by this it is clear that their R2C is not taken in account....If you ask to a young Cameroonian if he recognises himself in the city, he will reply that, because he can't get a job, or work, he can not participate really in the governance of city.... Minfegue, Cameroon

There is need for city authorities to recognize the crying voices and choices of young people....if we are to save the future generation. Recently in cities there is a lot of rural urban migration among young people, devastating youth unemployment, child sacrifice, drug abuse, sexual exploitation and assault, rape, stigmatic neighbourhoods, broken families, child recruitment as soldiers, child labour, effects of HIV/Aids low incomes in families etc. All these have impacted negatively on the lives of young people. Young people in cities need a platform, a strong voice, conferences and forums to address the challenges that affect them. ddunguadrian, Uganda

Children are considered in development plans as a mere numerical value to calculate the number of schools and health centres required, with no real consideration of where facilities should be located or the functional uses of the places according to the social class needs. abdulrazak India

City Users

- 4.7 Another group often ignored in policy analysis and urban programming is those who visit the city but do not classify as residents - the many commuters, guest workers or foreign nationals who are often marginalised in policy, as these posts illustrate:

Special attention should be paid to people who come to the cities to work either on a daily basis or seasonal basis. The regular commuters form a very significant part of the day time population of a City. There are others who come to the City as labourers, specially in unorganized sectors (the informal economy) or on a seasonal basis though they maintain their rural roots. Both of these groups do not contribute directly to city finances though their contribution to economy of Cities is significant. Their income is earned in the City but gets invested largely elsewhere. Their demand from the City is also limited. And, as such their R2C must also be recognized. slbonerjee, India

There are many cities whose daytime population is significantly larger than the night-time population. Some city populations actually swell during working hours by as much as 40-50%, if not more. These commuters reside outside the city but are part of the city population during the day and they are significant contributors to many aspects of urban life - both to the city product and to generating traffic jams. These 'citizens' should be included as a major group in the debate on the right to the city and the commensurate responsibilities associated with that right. Maseland, Kenya

Migrants

- 4.8 Tanja, UK (Italy), wrote passionately of the need to recognise the contribution of migrants in the make-up of the city, citing Lefebvre's vision of cities as 'spaces offering the opportunity for people who are framed as 'different' to live with each other'. She argued that:

Foreign citizens, or cross-border migrants are often excluded from legal entitlement from even the most basic services, their children denied access to education on the ground of not holding the right passport, they face difficulties in accessing health services etc. Both internal and international migrants....are often seen as not deserving the city, as solely scavenging what has been sown by those who rightfully belong....

But let's pause and think: what do these migrants do? They provide care services to the urban middle classes and the elites; they are the domestic workers and nannies.... They provide the cheap labour that supports the garment workshops... They grow the vegetables that supply the fresh produce markets....They are the bus drivers, the workers in meat processing factories; they do all the dirty, unsafe, low paid jobs that make urban life possible. They often make huge investment into their migration project, selling their land or their house, all of their own account,.....and they are expected to continue to fend for themselves, framed as non-citizens,....Just imagine who does your cooking, your cleaning,....who sews the clothes you are wearing, and think again whether only some have legitimate rights to the city and the benefits it has to offer.
Tanja, UK (Italy)

4.9 Similar views are expressed by kariuki of Keyna:

The most marginalized groups are largely the latest immigrants (geographically and temporally) who are not really considered citizens; but labour borrowed from the rural hinterland for the city's convenience. kariuki Kenya

R2C and the Informal Economy

4.10 The marginalisation faced by workers in the informal economy is very similar to that of migrants. Dr Edmundo Werna¹⁹, leading expert on the informal economy from the ILO, commented from a perspective of urban labour and livelihoods:

I take the opportunity to highlight the importance of the 'right to work' and the 'right to decent working conditions'. These are key elements of the right to the city and should be supported hand-in-hand with the right to access to shelter and services. Without proper livelihoods, urban residents will have little opportunity to fight for their (overall) right to the city. There is of course no magic bullet to create employment and adequate working conditions for all. This is a struggle to be fought on many fronts. Some have already been mentioned, such as the crucial issue of migrant workers and their rights. Many cities have been literally built by migrants - and then such migrants do not have rights to live in the cities they themselves built....The issue of the 'right to appropriate working conditions' is fundamental. Edmundo, Switzerland

4.11 JNBona (Philippines) sees the informal economy as an important component of every urban market: it provides a significant source of government revenues; is a major focus for low-priced goods; compensates for the market gaps in supply and demand, and is the main opportunity for enabling the marginalized sector to achieve a share in the local economy. In Jamaica, patgreen argued that street-vending must be understood in the context of Caribbean culture, to explain why market buildings are often empty while the sidewalks throng with traders. Accepting a *fait accompli*, municipalities collect 'market' fees on the sidewalk and cellphone companies design painted booths to 'control' the phenomenon.

4.12 Several participants challenged the forceful evictions of informal economy workers:

The apparent disorganized nature of the informal sector in most developing countries (especially in Africa) is a direct consequence of the failings of the city (city managers)....Adequate infrastructure and facilities are not provided for them to conduct their business in an organized manner and when invariably they spill into the streets or informal open spaces they are hounded and traumatized....Street clearances invariably have both economic and social (sometimes even political) costs. If, however,

¹⁹ Dr. Edmundo Werna is an urban expert and the Focal Point for Urban Development, and Senior Construction Specialist, Sectoral Activities Department, ILO (International Labour Office), Geneva, Switzerland

necessary attention is paid to the informal sector and adequate provisions made for the operators as bona fide residents of the city,....problems....can be abated at minimal cost and higher socio-economic gains. HARUNAPAM Nigeria

In Kolkata... a difficult fight is going on. This involves the unauthorized occupation of the pavements of almost all the important thoroughfares of the city by....hawkers. They sell everything from electronic goods to cheap garments, not to mention food and vegetables....People somehow like them for the price and choice they offer in spite of great difficulties in using the pavements for walking.

The hawkers are very well organized in 'unions' and have strong support from political parties. In spite of 'PILs'(Public Interest Litigations) and Court orders for their eviction,.... it has not been possible to enforce the Law fully....Attempts to rehabilitate them in well-built shopping arcades have failed because the locations were totally wrong. We planners suggest that, the hawkers being entirely dependant upon pedestrian traffic, the solution lies in planning proper pedestrian ways and plazas. But it has a long way to go. sbonnerjee, India

- 4.13 **dld** highlighted specific problems faced by home-based workers, the most invisible of all informal workers, as they do not appear in public paces but work instead through middlemen and contractors. Critically in the countries of South and South-East Asia up to 80 percent of home-based workers are women, and home-based work forms the majority of women's work:

Because of the gender, income status,....and invisibility (of home-based workers), their participation in urban policy-making is unlikely unless they are organized. In some cities - e.g., in Bangkok, or parts of India or the Philippines.... policy makers do appear to be willing to work with organized groups of informal workers, including women workers. ... (but) where migration is currently underway and where land grabbing and developer/political interests are at stake (e.g., in Bangladesh and Cambodia), it appears that progress can be made most effectively through patient and relatively quiet work, building of long-term and ongoing relationships between local organizations, international organizations, and sympathetic city officials....dld, Thailand

Whose R2C? - Summary of Views

- 4.14 Vulnerability of women to discrimination, exploitation in low-waged labour and domestic and other violence, led several participants to call for an explicit gender dimension to the R2C. Representatives of the Huairou Commission and Women in Cities International argued that women make immense contributions, raising families, working in poorly paid jobs and organising to secure a better future for themselves, which the R2C agenda should reflect.
- 4.15 At least two of the participants were youth workers from Africa and argued that the voices of children and young people should also be heard in debates on the R2C. The elderly were also mentioned, but only in passing. Another group explicitly mentioned were 'city users', for example the day-time population of commuters who are not classed as residents, other visitors and temporary workers.
- 4.16 Discrimination is faced by urban migrants and many of those working informally - often there is an overlap. An impassioned plea for the rights of migrants called for consideration of the jobs they do, the dirty, unsafe and low-paid jobs that keep cities functioning. It was argued that without proper livelihoods, urban residents will have little opportunity to fight for their rights, and that city councils were failing to address the needs of informal economy workers.

5. Taking Forward the *Right to the City*?

An Agenda for the Future

- 5.1 Week 4 of the debate looked at how to build on experiences highlighted in the high-profile UNESCO and UN-HABITAT project on *Urban Policies and the Right to the City*²⁰ and through experiences of participants in the e-Debate, through innovations in Latin America and elsewhere, to take forward the R2C.

Role of International Agencies

- 5.2 The critical role of international agencies in raising awareness of the R2C agenda was highlighted by several participants in the e-Debate, although there were few specific recommendations. AnaSu made a plea for a special 'space for urban inhabitants' at WUF5 in Rio de Janeiro.

Working towards WUF5 in Rio de Janeiro with peoples' organizations from Brazil and Latin America, and with the support of many different international urban networks, we ask UN-Habitat to consider a special physical space and effective role for urban inhabitants inside the WUF 5. Otherwise, we'll have to make the space in front, which would be a pity. Tomorrow, this exchange of comments on "Whose the R2C?" will close. We hope that we, representatives of the civil society will have all the necessary support to have a real space inside WUF. AnaSu, Chile

Collective Action

- 5.3 Many participants highlighted the importance of collective action and bottom-up processes of development in operationalising the R2C, and two particularly rich examples are reported here. Urban policy expert **Caroline Skinner**, suggested four aspects necessary for implementing an R2C agenda based on her work with the global research and policy network WIEGO²¹:

First is the importance of collective action among the poor - the Self Employed Women's Association in India, with over 1 million members, is a particularly interesting case. SEWU is a union, has co-operatives, but also provides services like banking and health care....(and) the Mahila Housing Trust....

Second it is important that there are) platforms within the city for these voices to be heard. SEWA's experience shows that some cities are more receptive than others..

Third is the importance of legal reform. Using Wiki technology we have set up an observatory of laws that impact on the working poor....I have been quite struck by how many countries still have colonial bylaws in place...

Fourth is the importance of alternative visions for cities. For cities in the South, aspirations to be.... 'global' cities or 'world class' cities are often behind exclusionary practises like removal of informal settlements and street traders. The focus on the right to the city as well as the good examples of how this might be....give substance to Jenny Robinson's delightful call for cities to accept their 'ordinariness'. Caroline Skinner

- 5.4 **Jacqueline Leavitt** also cited the impact of collective movements as catalysts for change.

Since the mid-1990s, the Huairou Commission, a coalition of grassroots groups including GROOTS International (Grassroots Organizations Operating Together in Sisterhood)

²⁰ Brown, A. and Kristiansen, A. (2008) *Urban Policies and the Right to the City: Rights, responsibilities and citizenship*, Paris, UNESCO, <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0017/001780/178090e.pdf>

²¹ Caroline Skinner is a Senior Researcher at the African Centre for Cities, University of Cape Town, South Africa, and Urban Policies coordinator for the global policy network, WIEGO, *Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing*

has collaborated with women's groups in order to transform needs into demands and negotiations for acquiring rights. Since 2002, with support from UN HABITAT and USAID, the Huairou Commission piloted Local to Local Dialogues with GROOTS Kenya, the Information Centre of Independent Women's Forum, the Centre of Services and Exchange for the Southern Cone, Women Advancement Trust, the Czech Mothers Centres, and the Forum for Women in Democracy.... Jacqueline Leavitt

She also discussed the successful Grassroots Women's International Academies (GWIAs) in creating spaces where female leaders exchange stories and learn about different strategies.

- 5.5 The case of a public hearing organised on displacements in Ahmedabad by a forum *Our Inclusive Ahmedabad*, on the last day of the e-Debate illustrated how the urban poor can act to generate debate on alternative forms of urban development:

Ahmedabad, has a history of inclusive development emanating from Gandhian philosophy,....(but is now facing) many conflicts....The latest instance is of large displacements of the urban poor from their informal shelter and informal sector livelihoods,....(for the) large urban renewal projects of the city - 'The Riverfront Development', the Kankaria Lakefront development, road widening, the prestigious BRTS and other projects....While some of the displaced find a housing under the BSUP component of the JNNURM,....many have (no) proof of being in the city in 1976, the cut-off date (for rehousing)....(and) even those eligible for rehabilitation, have been dumped in the wilderness on the city's periphery....A public hearing was organized by concerned citizens of Ahmedabad to bring to fore the various issues of displacements experienced by the poor....and to generate ideas on alternatives forms of urban development that include the lives and livelihoods of the poor. Darshini, India

- 5.6 Several participants raised the issue of the need for citizens to take responsibility for their own R2C, as this post graphically illustrates:

For me as a citizen, I would say that I am responsible for the city and I have to transform the city, because at the end of the day I am the one benefiting. Unfortunately, in most cases we have the mentality that, for example, cleaning the city is the responsibility of the City /Town Assemblies.

The way forward

- 1. Let the community establish - for example in water services - the Water Users Association...(that) would be involved from feasibility to the implementation phase, and because they will be fully involved they will feel part and parcel of the city ...*
- 2. Let the city mobilise the resources of NGOs in order to improve the city, but still with involvement of the community....*
- 3. Using participatory-based initiatives and advocacy is very important. UNFORTUNATELY IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES LIKE MALAWI, people lack information, and forget that every citizen has right to information and remember only that INFORMATION IS POWERDoreen, Malawi.*

Urban Space

- 5.7 Both Nadir Kinossian, writing about post-socialist cities and Barberis writing about research in Buenos Aires argued that the spatial dimension is important for taking the R2C forward - the argument that slums should be seen as part of the wider city was, of course, an important feature of the Favela Bairro upgrading programme in Rio de Janeiro.

The privatisation of urban space by various groups deprives other groups of having access to urban space, undermining their right to the city. This can be done through restricting access to urban areas and buildings, commercialising services, introducing user's fees, exercising a zero tolerance regime towards "social pollutants" and the "others" who do not fit the profile of a desirable customer.

The post-socialist city has undergone the process of liberalisation of land and property markets which is why the....privatisation of urban spaces is often seen as a

legitimate action, a part of general transition towards a market economy, and 'harmonisation' with the west. The process has taken various forms, from the proliferation of gated communities, commercialisation of public spaces to gradual elimination or degradation of spaces that fail to generate immediate return. Many privatisation movements are driven by security concerns. Nadir Kinossian, Russia

One of the main features in developing countries is the strong and evident social inequality....The mosaic of Latin American cities is critically fragmented and day-by-day it affects the functioning of the urban system. When thinking about the right to the city how must we consider the slums, the inner city, the ghettos, etc? Even if these are important parts of the city, often they do not seem to be part of the whole. From this viewpoint 'the right to the city' can be considered as a set of rules to introduce in the city management process? Or as the minimum quality of life that must be ensured to the citizens in all urban contexts? Barberis, Italy (Argentina)

Freedom of Information

- 5.8 The importance of free access to information was an attribute raised by participants, as this example from India illustrates:

The right to live is already established in India, but not easy access to resources like education and health. The (national) Government and the States are doing their best to provide basic education and health to all the citizens which are now Basic Rights (set out in the Indian Constitution). India has also introduced a Right to Information Act and Opened Citizen's Charters to claim basic rights and access to information. This is true democracy in India. NNSastry, India

- 5.9 Another dimension of access to information is the need to measure and monitor different aspects of the R2C, so that its implementation can be assessed over time. One participant from Nepal suggested indicators for the R2C to include:

For the 'right to the city' I propose the following indicators:

- 1. Predictability of travel within a city*
- 2. Cleanliness of rivers and other water bodies*
- 3. Cleanliness of the city*
- 4. Purity of air to breath and to see the sky*
- 5. Certainty of a safe and reliable water supply*
- 6. Safety and security of roads for children, women and everyone*
- 7. Communication facilities*
- 8. Equity in access to public property for all kind of people*
- 9. Freedom to practice cultural practice*
- 10. Availability of basic needs*
- 11. Availability of basic health facilities*
- 12. Non-discrimination for formal, informal resident*
- 13. Visibility for tourists*
- 14. Resistance to climate change*

Namraj, Nepal

City Environments

- 5.10 Many participants linked the R2C to environmental protection. As Nicholas Stern argued, 'the two greatest problems of our times - overcoming poverty in the developing world and combating climate change - are inextricably linked'²². Some participants highlighted the link between poor environments and poverty - the poor and vulnerable often live marginal or hazardous locations, in areas polluted in the processes of industrialization that underpins urban development. Climate change was also at the forefront of many people's minds, as the e-Debate closed on the same day as the 2009 United Nations Climate Change Conference in Copenhagen.

²² Stern, N. (2009) *Blueprint for a Safer Planet*, London, Bodley Head

- 5.11 Evelyn from Mexico raised concerns that new immigrants often live in city neighbourhoods where environmental and public health risk are rife, and noted the increasing recognition of the links between environmental stress and violent conflict. However, she finds hope in:

...the flow of discourses and democratic movements...from the "Ecological Modernization" concept and green industrialism policies in northern Europe,...to the Green Radicalism and survivalism...(in) cities from Brazil to India. While the first usually involves partnerships and/or financial cooperation with the private sector, the second usually engages bottom-up movements...Contradictions (can also occur)...like the green Curitiba in Brazil, born from military eco-legacy, or the company-branded parks such as Godrej Garden City in Ahmedabad, India. Evelyn, Mexico

- 5.12 Participants were passionate in their call to link the R2C debate with the climate change agenda to achieve fairer and more equitable cities where pollution and fossil fuel consumption are minimised and where environmental quality is improved. The views in this post from Nigeria were widely shared:

Climate change is 'a vital issue which is of immense importance to cities in developing countries... Most of us in developing countries have not yet fully grasped the full impact of climate change on our cities and are still carrying on as if all is well...the earlier we start strategizing on methods of ameliorating the impact of climate change on our cities, the better for us. One of the ways that may be open to us is to focus our attention on strategies for green urban development which should include legislation to ensure environment friendly developments...as has been loudly orchestrated at Copenhagen, most developing countries lack the funds to tackle this big problem head on. Sadder still is the fact that the most vulnerable group is the urban poor. Developing countries must rise up to this challenge before its too late. HARUNAPAM Nigeria

- 5.13 Examples of both good and bad practice were given:

Mexico city has just won a prestigious prize given by Harvard University...for its Bus Rapid Transport called the MetroBus. The program has replaced more than 800 minibuses, gives more space to bikes and walkways in the city. In four years, it has reduced 80,000 tons of greenhouse gas emissions and aims to achieve 300,000 tons....The model seems transferable to other big and medium cities...(although there have been some criticisms about lack of driver training and lack of planning)...Still, the system is tackling the biggest challenge, changing the culture of one of the biggest cities in the world into a greener behaviour. Evelyn, Mexico

The exchange between Nairobi and Makueni, a rural down-river neighbour, sees Makueni exporting building construction sand, charcoal and cheap labour to Nairobi. These exports denude the Makueni environment, underline the futility of developing any skills or industry and siphon able-bodied people. In turn, Nairobi supplies used clothes and shoes, absent spouses, a heavily polluted Athi River and cultural dilution to Makueni. These translate into skilled job opportunities loss, disease, including HIV-AIDS, and broken families. kariuki, Kenya

Cultural Heritage

- 5.14 Several participants highlighted the cultural component of the R2C.

Another important aspect is the cultural component of...(the right to the city). Groups exercise their right to the city by establishing control over symbolically important sites and urban spaces. The notion of contested urban space implies that different ethnic, religious and social groups use urban space and imagery to express ideas of power and domination...by populating the cultural landscape with symbols, religious buildings, monuments, language signs and other elements of urban imagery.

The post-socialist city has witnessed many conflicts over the right to control symbolic urban landscape and use it to promote (or destroy) policies values and identities...(with) attempts to get rid of the 'unwanted past' both left from the Socialist and the Nazi periods in former Eastern Germany; attempts to erase the traces of the Soviet occupation in the Baltic states etc. Exercising the right to the city and its

heritage and history plays an important role in many conflicts. Nadir Kinossian, Russia

- 5.15 For **patgreen** of Jamaica, the cultural component of the R2C can unify communities and transform run-down historic areas:

In the Caribbean there are increased pressures of urbanism and poverty inside our historic districts....(and) social concerns of crime and other stigma....Interestingly, some of these heritage sites are potential nominations to the World Heritage List,....(to redress) the imbalance of Caribbean sites on the World Heritage List....Caribbean governments have acknowledged that historic preservation and conservation extend beyond the buildings sometimes sadly to the detriment of the physical heritage....

Our regional governments see the potential of heritage to diversify the region's tourism product, which is the main foreign exchange earner. Initiatives have been fostered for "community tourism",...(and) I highlight a UNESCO cross-cutting theme project, YouthPATH (youth poverty alleviation through tourism and heritage). I am witnessing that as professionals when we speak about the urban cultural landscape, this is unifying communities even across political lines and gang borders, and that there is consensus, especially with potential international attention, fostering participation. I therefore recommend that Taking Forward The Right To The City should include the regeneration of the cultural and natural heritage.

Latin America and the R2C

- 5.16 In Latin America, the R2C has been a particularly powerful catalyst for change, perhaps inspired by social action and spread of democracy during the 1980s and 1990s. The R2C has been enshrined in national constitutions in Brazil, Ecuador, Bolivia and is being used to promote progressive urban policy in Chile and Mexico City. Some participants asked for more information about the experience of implementing the R2C in these countries, although the debate did not really address this question, and many authors cited its importance in driving innovative policy

- 5.17 As **Edésio Fernandes** noted, legislation in Brazil and Colombia had started to implement the concept of the R2C. In Brazil, the main legal framework governing urban development and management was the internationally acclaimed 2001, *City Statute*, which explicitly recognised the R2C as a collective right (see Section 3.8 above). He argued that the Brazilian case provides a sound basis for understanding the R2C as a legal right.

- 5.18 **AnaSu**²³ wrote how, in Chile, and elsewhere in Latin America, low-cost housing programmes have increased socio-spatial discrimination and stigmatised the poor. The R2C movement in Latin America is partly a response to this polarisation:

Especially in Latin America, many different initiatives of civil society are implementing the human rights with social justice. It is the aspiration for the redistribution of the profits that the cities generate - because of their concentration of peoples, goods, money, cultural diversities and conflicts. The R2C is also a political banner, with a great diversity of experiences conquests, defeats and re-articulation of new expressions. From the local initiatives and alliances with many social actors, step by step, the R2C has become part of national Constitutions - in Brazil, Ecuador, Bolivia- and Mexico City and its 20 millions dwellers. The R2C is a practice to implement public policies respecting the well being of everyone. AnaSu, Chile

²³ *Ana Sugeranyes is an architect and General Secretary of the Habitat International Coalition - a global network working on housing and land rights. She refers to the Habitat International Coalition website:*
<http://www.hic-net.org/habitatthemesresults.php?t=3000&s=0&dt=Right%20to%20the%20City>

5.19 Another example was from LeoV (USA), who suggested that the new constitution in Ecuador (in 2008) enshrines a R2C 'without establishing clear policies that delegate responsibility for implementation', leaving open the usual challenges of funds, follow-through and responsibility. He indicated that the Ecuadorian association of municipalities has asked for a period of 'reflection and debate', while social groups such as the *Contracto Social por la Vivienda* are looking for ways to manifest the right.

5.20 Others cited the importance of bottom-up action in implementing the R2C in the 'flexible and spontaneous context' of Latin America:

There are many examples of how bottom-up process take place in the LA cities: informal settlements, in the last decades, have developed further than the traditional planned city did. The Cartoneros organization, the informal charter services to the city centres, the self-construction of entire neighbourhoods, and so on. Instead of thinking the right to the city as a set of rules, laws or instruments, I would like to imagine these rights as a bottom-up conception of the society. Barberis, Italy (Argentina)

Barberis also pointed out differing aspirations and interpretations of city space he has found in his research in Buenos Aires:

For those who live in slums the right to the city means to have...(rights to) the piece of land where they live, or.... just to have the ability to apply for a job. For the residents of gated communities the right to the city means....freedom to live in the "open" city with no fear of being robbed or kidnapped...For the citizens of the open city, those who live in the traditional town...the right to the city has yet another meaning, such as the quality of public transport or the open green spaces. So, in your opinion is it possible to delineate "the right to the city" as a universal principle? Barberis, Italy (Argentina)

5.21 Sonia Dias (Brazil) gave an example of social activism in Brazil by waste-pickers:

In the last 10-15 years, there has been an increase in the number of organized waste pickers into cooperatives and/or associations in Brazil....(who) have framed their demands as 'rights to the city', and claim they have the right to be recognised as service providers in recycling. Since 1990 support for organizations of waste pickers... from different levels of governments has grown....resulting in the formation of partnerships of many waste pickers' organizations with local governments in municipal recycling schemes....One important contribution in catalysing these changes was that of the Waste and Citizenship Forums....

The main platform of these Forums includes: eradication of child and labour at open dumps; eradication of open dumps, and implementation of sanitary landfills, and recycling partnerships between local governments and pickers' associations. The National Waste & Citizenship Forum has given more visibility to the social and environmental importance of the work carried out by the waste pickers....(which has) inspired other groups of pickers to organise,....(leading) to the creation of the National Movement of Waste Pickers (MNCR) in 2001. Best from Brazil, Sonia Dias, Brazil

Conclusions

5.22 A final flurry of posts crystallised the debate on 'Taking Forward the R2C' in Week 4 with several key recommendations. The importance of international agencies in promoting the R2C agenda was highlighted with a plea from representatives of Habitat International Coalition for space for urban inhabitants to meet at WUF5 in Rio.

5.23 Four facets were seen as essential for the voices of the poor to be heard: (1) collective action; (2) political space for representation; (3) legal reform; and (4) a challenge to the pernicious 'vision of cities' that mimics the 'global city' image of the North which is often used to justify exclusionary practices. Public space is seen as a mirror of inclusion and participants challenged the privatisation and commodification of public spaces in market economies. Basic rights of access to

information and adequate monitoring of urban change were also highlighted as important to furthering the R2C.

- 5.24 A strong body of opinion argued the necessity of linking the R2C to the climate change agenda. It was argued that environments under stress exacerbate social and violent conflict in the struggle to claim scarce resources. Two aspects are important here: (1) mitigating the impact of climate change on city environments; and (2) promoting green urban technologies to minimise carbon emissions.
- 5.25 Latin America is amassing considerable expertise in rights-based approaches to development, but this is not always readily accessible. An observatory of good practice could be promoted through existing mechanisms - such as the World Urban Campaign's living practices approach.
- 5.26 Perhaps most fundamental is the underlying meaning of many of the posts throughout the e-Debate. As highlighted by the global economic crisis, the poverty impacts of a free-market economy are profound and unless challenged through a reconceptualisation of urban rights, with improved regulation of markets including land markets, the R2C agenda will necessarily be relatively limited in its impact. This was perhaps aptly expressed by Jan Roters reflecting on David Harvey's work when he said:

First, the "freedom to make and remake our cities" is much more than just a right to visit or stay in the city - it inevitably challenges the right of property as the basic legal framework for urban redevelopment. Second...the proposal (is) of "a common rather than an individual right": This argument inevitably challenges the idea of the individual as foundation for legal rights and property. Jan Roters, Germany

Reflections on the e-Debate

- 5.27 The e-Debate was an interesting process which demonstrates an institutional commitment from UN-HABITAT to promote global debate on the R2C concept. There were no frivolous posts and everyone had a commitment to the ideals of the R2C and ambition to achieve a more just and fair society.
- 5.28 Unfortunately the e-Debate did not manage to span the language barrier and contributions are mostly from the Anglophone world, including sub-Saharan Africa, North America and Australia. The moderating team for this e-Debate went to considerable lengths to overcome this bias and included English, Spanish, French, Portuguese, Russian, Arabic and Chinese speakers to accept posts in any of these languages. Notification of the e-Debate was widely circulated through professional and other networks in the developed and developing world. It was particularly disappointing that there were no contributors from South East Asia, where specific invitations were made.
- 5.29 This raises the question of why people do not participate. People may not have seen the e-Debate advertised or may have been too busy to take part. As some posts indicated, in some countries it is not safe for professionals to contribute to open debates and there may be no tradition of critique. Contributions from nearly 60 people on five continents is therefore impressive.
- 5.30 Particular thanks should go to those who contributed energetically and enthusiastically throughout the four weeks of debate, notably Minfegue of Cameroon, JNBona of the Philippines, Namraj of Nepal, Bwomezi and ycwu of Uganda, and Abubakar Sadiq Sani of Nigeria, among others.

Appendix 1: Statistics

Contributors' countries

Argentina, Australia, Azerbaijan, Bangladesh, Brazil, Cameroon, Canada, Chile, Egypt, France, Germany, Greece, India, Italy, Jamaica, Kenya, Lebanon, Malawi, Mexico, Nepal, Nigeria, Norway, Philippines, Russia, Rwanda, Sierra Leone, Switzerland, South Africa, Spain, Thailand, Uganda, UK, USA, Zambia

	Country	Contributors	Posts
<i>Why the Right to the City?</i>	Kenya	5	10
	India	4	8
	Canada	3	3
	Nigeria	3	7
	Uganda	3	8
	Egypt	2	2
	USA	2	3
	Australia	1	1
	Brazil	1	1
	Cameroon	1	2
	Chile	1	1
	Germany	1	1
	Greece	1	1
	Jamaica	1	1
	Mexico	1	1
	Nepal	1	3
	Philippines	1	7
	Rwanda	1	3
	Sierra Leone	1	6
	UK	1	1
<i>Totals</i>	<i>20 Countries</i>	<i>35</i>	<i>70</i>

	Country	Contributors	Posts
<i>What is the Right to the City</i>	Uganda	3	3
	India	2	3
	Kenya	2	7
	Mexico	2	2
	Nepal	1	2
	Argentina	1	1
	Australia	1	1
	Azerbaijan	1	1
	Bangladesh	1	5
	Brazil	1	4
	Cameroon	1	3
	Canada	1	1
	France	1	1
	Italy	1	4
	Nigeria	1	1
	Norway	1	1
	Philippines	1	2
	Russia	1	2
	Switzerland	1	1
	USA	1	2
Zambia	1	2	
<i>Totals</i>	<i>20 Countries</i>	<i>26</i>	<i>49</i>

	Country	Contributors	Posts	
<i>Whose Right to the City</i>	Nigeria	2	8	
	Bangladesh	1	1	
	Brazil	2	2	
	Cameroon	1	2	
	Chile	1	2	
	Italy	1	1	
	Jamaica	1	1	
	Lebanon	1	1	
	Mexico	1	1	
	Nepal	1	3	
	Norway	1	1	
	Philippines	1	4	
	Russia	1	1	
	Switzerland	1	1	
	Uganda	1	1	
	USA	1	1	
	Zambia	1	2	
<i>Totals</i>	<i>17 Countries</i>	<i>19</i>	<i>33</i>	
<i>Taking Forward the R2C</i>	Uganda	3	3	
	Philippines	2	2	
	Jamaica	1	2	
	Russia	1	2	
	Argentina	1	1	
	Cameroon	1	4	
	Canada	1	1	
	India	1	1	
	Malawi	1	1	
	Mexico	1	1	
	Nepal	1	3	
	South Africa	1	1	
	Spain	1	1	
	Thailand	1	1	
	<i>Totals</i>	<i>14 Countries</i>	<i>17</i>	<i>24</i>
<i>General</i>	Uganda	2	6	
	Canada	1	1	
	India	1	2	
	Mexico	1	1	
	Nepal	1	1	
	Nigeria	1	2	
	Philippines	1	1	
<i>Totals</i>	<i>7 Countries</i>	<i>8</i>	<i>14</i>	
<i>All topics</i>	<i>Totals</i>	<i>34 countries</i>	<i>59</i>	<i>189</i>

Moderating Team

Alison Brown, Reader, School of City & Regional Planning, Cardiff University, Wales, UK
 assisted by: Nezar Atta Alla Kafafy, Nadir Kinossian, Virginia Marques, Evelyn Nava Fischer,
 and Shen Jie of Cardiff University.