

**BAMAKO DISTRICT DEVELOPMENT  
STRATEGIC PLANNING PROJECT**

**Mission Appraisal Report**

Bamako, 7 to 14 OCTOBER 2001

by  
Dr. **KOBY** Assa Théophile,  
National University of Côte d'Ivoire,  
Department of Geography, Cocody, Abidjan

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>3</b>
I- PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVES OF MISSION	3
II- SUMMARY OF INTERACTIONS WITH REPRESENTATIVES OF STAKEHOLDERS ENCOUNTERED	4
ALPHALOG, Coordinator	
Urban Administration	
Higher Echelons of the Administration	
Civil Society	
Private Sector and Business Concerns	
International Organizations	
III- BASIC INFORMATION ON THE CITY OF BAMAKO	10
IV- DESCRIPTION OF THE CONDUCTING OF THE PROCESS	13
V- OUTPUTS AND RESULTS OF THE CDS	20
VI- A REVIEW OF THE CDS	22
VII- PROPOSALS	23
<b>LIST OF ACRONYMS</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>ANNEXES</b>	<b>25</b>

## INTRODUCTION

This report contains the major findings of the mission fielded in Bamako, from 7 to 14 October 2001, under the BNETD support to the Urban Management Programme (UMP). The terms of reference of this mission relate to the appraisal of the Bamako District Development Strategic Plan Study.

A steering committee for the formulation of the strategic development plan for this District was officially created on the basis of the Decision N° 032/MD-B of 20 December 2000, by the Ministry of Territorial Administration and Local Communities. Under the chairmanship of the Mayor of the District, the role of this committee is to:

- define the major orientations of the strategic plan;
- create favorable conditions for the conducting of the consultancy;
- monitor and evaluate elaboration of the City Development Strategy (CDS).

At the end of our mission, information gathered was analyzed in accordance with the terms of reference along the following lines:

- purpose and objectives of the mission;
- basic information on the city of Bamako;
- description of the City Development Strategy (CDS);
- outputs and results of the CDS;
- analysis of the results of the CDS.

### I- PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVE OF MISSION

#### 1.1. Purpose

The purpose of the mission was to determine the conditions and modalities for the elaboration of the Bamako District Development Strategic Plan on behalf of the UMP/BNETD partnership.

#### 1.2. Objectives

##### *General Objectives:*

- Follow-up on the activities undertaken by the ALPHALOG, our consultant for the elaboration entrusted to the UMP-BNETD partnership;
- Review the CDS process by using the case of Bamako City to make recommendations for other African cities.

##### *Specific Objectives:*

- Collect basic information on the city of Bamako;
- Conduct a description of the city and the CDS process;
- Present the outputs and results of the CDS;
- Conduct a review of the CDS process;
- Provide technical support to the local team of experts in charge of the CDS process where possible;
- Prepare an evaluation report.

### 1.3. Mission Circumstances

The mission was conducted in a context marked by the lack of major activities in conjunction with the conducting of the study on the strategic development plan of Bamako District. The mission entrusted to ALPHALOG had indeed reached the strategic planning stage and consequently the aim was to assess the results obtained compared to the CDS.

## II- SUMMARY OF INTERACTIONS WITH REPRESENTATIVES OF STAKEHOLDERS MET

This section of the report is essential to understand the summary tables that will be presented. It highlights:

- The involvement of these stakeholders in the process;
- The quality of this involvement;
- The difficulties;
- The reasons for keeping persons who would have been difficult to involve in the process;
- The quality of leadership of the city.

### **ALPHALOG, PROJECT COORDINATOR.**

The first work session with ALPHALOG represented by Mr. **SEYDOU DIAKITE**, took place on Monday 8 October 2001 at the NGO's head office. It entailed discussions from 8:00 a.m. to 11:00 a.m. on the status of the project in relation to the initial schedule. At our request, the documents that were produced after the various phases of the process were made available to us, with the exception of the one on the **vision and strategies**, which was only provided us in the afternoon of 13 August 2001. Information was provided on the difficulties encountered by the municipal administration in conducting the process, its leadership role and the involvement of stakeholders.

The work programme which we proposed to follow with the collaboration of ALPHALOG was jointly examined and approved, subject to possible modifications by the steering committee at the District city hall. It was agreed that appointments should be planned with the support of Mr. **BOUKARY DIARRA**, the Technical Secretary of the steering committee. It was also agreed that our discussions should be pursued each day in order to address possible difficulties that could affect the mission. It was also agreed that time should be set aside for a meeting with experts with a view to exchanging view on certain methodological aspects of the process.

### **Mr. DIARRA, TECHNICAL SECRETARY OF THE STEERING COMMITTEE.**

He drew up an appointment schedule based on his knowledge of the situation. We have had to adjust to the schedule of our interlocutors, necessitating, in some cases late appointments in homes. The availability and involvement of the technical secretary of the steering committee who personally accompanied us to all our appointments, except the one with World Health Organization (WHO), was a major advantage in the execution of the work plan for meetings.

## **ELECTED OFFICIALS OF THE DISTRICT**

In the absence of the District Mayor, his second deputy, responsible for developmental issues, **Mr. SOUNGALO KONE** was our only interlocutor and he granted us an appointment at the beginning and at the end of our mission during which the status of the project was reviewed. The Mayor expressed the interest of the District in the UMP Programme which had been introduced at a timely period since an interim 18-month programme had already been drawn up at the initiative of the District. The UMP work programme had the advantage of taking into account the viewpoints of all the social actors, notably their aspirations with a view to assisting in taking decisions concerning their future. Consequently, the District is awaiting the completion of the study that would result in a round table meeting with the donors.

## **HIGHER ECHELON OF THE ADMINISTRATION**

- **High Commission, District Supervisor**

**Mr. ISSA TAPO**, Director of the Office of the High Commission reported that this was the only structure that had not been informed about the progress of the project on the Bamako District Development Strategic Plan. The invitation letter from the Technical Secretariat of the High Commission was produced by Mr. Diarra as well as the reply from the High Commission confirming its participation in the sessions of the technical committee, and thereby absolve the steering technical committee of the project of any responsibility for the problem raised.

Mr. TAPO however stressed the importance and the interest of the supervisory organization in the project for the future and the importance to be given to the governance component in the implementation. The priority to be given to the disadvantaged communities, which is in line with the Government's preoccupation, is also a concern of the supervisory body. A document on the national solidarity activities initiated by the Government in its fight against poverty and social marginalization was given to us.

- **TOWN PLANNING MISSION**

Personalities met: **Mr. SEYDOU A. GUINDO** (former National Director of Planning, currently Head of the Town Planning Mission) and **Mr. ALIOU COULIBALY**, Head of the Mission Implementation Unit. This mission which was recently created by ordinance N° 043/P-RM of 21 September 2000 for a 5-year period is involved in the CDS process at three levels:

- Participation in committee work on the development plan;
- Participation in public day;
- Contribution to the formulation of a strategic development plan for the District which forms part of the official functions of the mission.

The experience of the mission will be made available to the District Urban Development project as in the past.

- **TERRITORIAL COMMUNITY DIRECTORATE**

Personality met: Mr. **SEGA KONATE**, Civil Administrator, and Division Chief of Local Elected Officers. This structure oversees 703 Malian communes, 49 districts, 8 regions and the communes of the Bamako District. Aware of the progress of the District Development Project, it also participated in the sessions of the strategic planning workshop. It has the responsibility for ensuring the regularity of legal instruments governing the running of the District city hall. It will play a key role in determining the legality of all the clauses of the District Strategic Development Plan. **The instruments are currently being reviewed** in order to address the problems raised by the fact that the communes and the city hall of the District do not fall under the same administrative supervising body.

- **THE REGIONAL DIRECTORATE OF YOUTH, SPORTS, ARTS AND CULTURE**

Personality met: Mr. **Jean-Baptiste SAMAKE**, Division Chief of the Cultural Heritage. He was involved in the process. The public day aroused considerable interest among the young participants who represented this section of the society and talked about its aspirations in a long-term development perspective. The Department of Youth, Sports and Culture can only support the project with regard to transversal activities between the youth and exploitable culture for cultural promotional purposes (entertainment, drama, dance, choreography, promotion of public reading, etc.).

## **CIVIL SOCIETY**

**Mrs. TRAORE NIAKORO DAMBA**, Chairwoman of a Women's NGO, Secretary General of the Association of West African Women, ex-Chairwoman and Honorary Chairwoman of the Women's Coordination of Commune 6.

The Women's Coordination of Commune 6 was invited by the Mayor of the District to take part in the process in view of its weight in national community life and in its neighborhood. For Mrs. Traoré, the public day aroused strong hope for the development of Bamako City. The concerted action dimension is an innovation to be sustained. The mainstreaming of gender issue is also a promising sign for women in the collective decision-making process.

The role of women in environmental protection is waning: it would be more visible and effective if resources provided by women to support this campaign were more substantial and modern: spades and wheel barrows are no longer suitable faced with the scale of the fight against poor hygienic conditions and **"the donkeys are tired"** and cannot cope with such obsolete resources in a fast growing city. The increase and modernization of resources would enhance women's participation. Women are also tired of persuading their grassroots members to use these outdated methods.

- **Mrs. DJENEBA CAMARA**, Secretary at the Women's Promotion for Mandé Development Association. Secretary at the Women's Coordination of Associations and the Women of Commune 4 NGO. Profession: secretary. She commended the initiative of the Mayor of the District in his bid to involve women of commune 4 in the process. She was proud to have been a member of a committee whose secretariat was run by a woman during the public day. The gender issue is

particularly important in view of the effort that remains to be undertaken to ensure greater equality between men and women. Other initiatives are needed to maintain the dynamism of the collective decision-making process for the future of the city of Bamako. Her greatest wish was that the project results in specific actions geared towards women as a way of stimulating this dynamism.

- **Mr. TOURE**, Head of the Médina Koura neighborhood, assisted by two advisors, a retired philosophy teacher.

This particularly enlightened traditional authority was invited by the District Mayor to participate in the process. The inclusion of community leaders is a practice developed by the new elected municipal officers of the District. The initiative started with an initial seminar in June 1999 with the same objectives. The mobilization capacity of the chief was essential in ensuring the participation of women, the youth, Imams and griots of the neighborhood who formed a Participatory Development Committee (CDP). This framework is ideal for identifying the priority needs of the society. The completion of the project resulting from concrete operations would be an additional motive for providing support to municipal initiatives.

## **PRIVATE SECTOR AND BUSINESS CONCERNS**

- **Association of Architects**

**Mr. YACOUBA GUINDO**, Secretary General of the Association of Architects.

Our association adhered to the project as soon as it received invitation from the District city hall since we viewed its participation to be important in the formulation of new strategies to improve urban living conditions. The parallel involvement of other professional groups is another source of satisfaction and stimulation for pursuing the project. Lastly, there is a growing tendency to resort to architects in the construction of new houses by an increasing number of Malians living outside.

- **Association of Consulting Engineers**

**Madam DEM MARIETOU**, Secretary General responsible for organization. The involvement of the association of engineers in the process resulted from an invitation from the Mayor of the District. Our motivation was evidenced by our participation in all the stages of the process. The organization of effective transportation is an issue that interests our association most. It was an opportunity to highlight the technical capacities of the country's engineers.

Three issues were of capital importance to her, beyond the problems of the association: women's participation in decision-making in a project of this scale; solution to environmental problems; the sound management of resources needed for the implementation of the project.

**Mr. MAKAN TOURE**, General Secretary of the Private Transport Owners Union

The union was invited by the Mayor of the District and participated unreservedly in the workshops of the public day. This kind of consultation is ideal to address transportation problems that affect the society, both in terms of benefits nuisances and safety problems (problems of parking places, invasion of pavements and safety problems, etc.); there was also the problem of the reactions of the public to measures that could be taken to address the problems mentioned: public lighting system, relationship with law enforcement agents, etc.). Transportation is an activity area that requires the involvement of the public in the search for and application of solutions.

Our hope in the future of the project is reflected by our desire to remain involved until lasting solutions are found. A sizeable financing would fulfil the hopes of the entire population and not only transport owners.

Madam **AMINATA TRAORE** and Mr. **BELINKE SIMPARA** respectively Chairwoman of the women of the vegetable market and Chairman of the Association of the Victims of Main Market fire and traders relocated to N'Golonina (ACVGMR).

Their involvement in the process followed an invitation by the Mayor. This involvement did not raise any special problems. Trading is their business and "we need to give support to the District Mayor in the search for solutions. The construction of new markets would make the city hall credible at the end of the project", she said.

Mr. **SEKOU CAMARA**, Lawyer by training – outgoing Chairman of the Economic Interest Group (GIE) for waste collection.

"The invitation by the District was both welcomed and an honor. We decided to involve ourselves in the process because we are practical people who are particularly sensitive to environmental problems. For a job as difficult and as unattractive, we find happiness in perseverance in our support to an authority that honors us. Our involvement did not pose any problem but scepticism would only set in if the hope to see the project result in concrete programmes is not fulfilled due to lack of financing and the results achieved locked up in drawers.

Our Association (GIE) has a national coordination, which is classified by the Tax Department as a commercial concern. This raises problems given the difficulties encountered in collecting CFA F 25/ day per family in the entire city for household waste collection. The project has come at the right time to sustain their hope. The implement used currently (barrels and donkeys) are outdated. The project must envisage an improvement in the foreseeable future entailing the use of mechanical equipment (tractors and trucks). We need to show evidence of the ability to manage in order to deserve confidence at this stage. The poverty reduction must change towards support for effectively developing resources.

This association entertained the fear that the process would come to a halt for lack of adequate support in financial terms. This would mean returning to the starting point with small resources and solutions of the poor. Effort should be made to promote effective SMEs for collecting and processing household wastes and moves towards creating major enterprises.

## **INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS.**

**Madam MAIGA, WHO.** Environment Engineer. Environmental Health Programme Officer.

WHO is following the process without being directly involved in its implementation. Under the healthy city programme support given to municipal services, the PDU can count on the WHO. Improvement in the living conditions and support to sanitation programmes have a direct relationship with poverty reduction. Mainstreaming of gender can be applied in many areas in this context. Support to the civil society can only be given through the communes and central administrations that have competencies in environmental health. The policies of the municipalities and State policies will get greater support if they are geared towards satisfying the needs of the communities according to their priorities. A principle governs decision-making by



WHO under poverty reduction: decide with the community and not for the community. WHO can only support strategic orientations and projects geared towards such goals in a donor round table.

**Mr. CHEIK TRAORE**, World Bank – Specialist in Infrastructure and Procurement.

The various stages of the process (analysis, group sessions, and public day) were followed by the World Bank, the KFW and the AFD, which are donors of the UNDP, initiator of the project. The District project is of interest to other African cities. Meetings have already been held with the District with a view to gathering information on the implementation of the project. The World Bank, which was invited to the seminar held at the CRES, has a major concern: the project must avoid duplication of operations and must serve to support complementary efforts notably support aimed at building capacities in urban management (computerization of financial directorates, strengthening of the financial autonomy of the District). Indeed, the District inherited a weak financial situation and structures that are too heavy to manage (estate service, cartography, rural engineering).

In the area of direct field actions, refuse collection strategies and community health projects targeting the most disadvantaged will be highlighted. He indicated the interest of the ADB in projects on liquid wastes. The World Bank is tuned in.

**Mr. KALFA SANOGO, UNDP**

The UNDP is highly interested and involved as the project initiator in the wider context of the housing project. The initial initiatives for support to the Bamako Urban Development Project began with Mr. DIEDI, former Advisor of the Resident Representative currently in New-York. The UNDP has already provided support to a minor urban project for women on refuse collection. Another UNDP project on housing was suspended as a result of the decrease in resources.

The important point is that projects that will result from the strategic reflection workshops should be well targeted. Support to decentralization is already attained for improving legislative instruments; training modules for elected officials and operational activities as those being conducted in the cities of MOPTI and TOUBOUCTOU.

The UNDP is in contact with the city hall, which is the project owner, and will be closely monitoring requests once they are formulated. The organization of round table meetings forms part of its responsibilities.

## **CONCLUSIONS**

The following major conclusions have emerged from our exchange of views with the stakeholders:

- Overall, there was **unanimity on the quality of leadership provided by the city in conducting the process.**
- There was not any particular difficulty in involving the stakeholders in the process. There was even some enthusiasm in the adherence explained by the communication strategy deployed by the District Mayor to invite the various actors to the work sessions, the public day and the workshop on strategy formulation.

- For committees requiring high level training, the resource persons invited as moderators or members had the adequate profile and competence either in carrying out their duties in the administration or in exerting their various liberal and business professions.
- Regarding the public day, the appeal to the population seems to have aroused considerable interest. This interest was reflected in the review of the list of participants. It indicates a high level of involvement of persons belonging to socially disadvantaged groups (women, disabled persons, household refuse collectors, etc.) who were highly encouraged by an initiative that associated them with the making of decisions concerning their future and that of their city.
- The questions of methodological approach and/or relating to the quality of participation and difficulties were often hidden or glossed over by our interlocutors. On the contrary, those relating to their interest in the project and solutions translated their hopes.
- The responses to be provided to the fulfillment of their hopes constitute a real challenge for the future of the project and the credibility of the officials of the District city hall.

### **III- BASIC INFORMATION ON THE CITY OF BAMAKO AND THE COUNTRY**

#### **3.1. Information on the District and its Poverty Profile**

Work sessions with Mr. Seydou Diakité helped identify problems that had not been resolved. The data drawn from the analytical study were weakened by the lack of adequate statistics in the data. For the same issue, the indicators may have different years, and the figures were not updated. Furthermore, the data were not gathered according to households. Data on poverty indicators therefore only have an indicative value. Table 1 provides a summary of the data.

Table 1: Basic information on the District of Bamako

<b>City, country</b>	Bamako, Republic of Mali
<b>City Population</b> <b>Country Population</b>	1 300 000 inhabitants (1) 10 000 000 inhabitants (1)
<b>Urban growth rate</b>	4.9% (1987-1992); 5.4% (1992-1997); 5.97% (1997-2000)
<b>Main functions of city</b>	Administrative, political, economic, (commerce, transport; industry and tourism), cultural and sport

<b>City poverty profile</b>	<p>-Population below poverty line: 33%</p> <p>Unemployment: 39% of countries unemployed of which 79% male 21% female</p> <p><b>Population with access to basic urban services</b></p> <p>-Potable water connection: <b>20% in 2000</b> against an estimated <b>23% in 2003</b></p> <p>64% of the population has access to stand pipes.</p> <p>-Population connected to the public sewerage system: <b>1.5%</b></p> <p>-Undeveloped neighborhoods: <b>38 out of 60</b></p> <p><b>40%</b> of houses had access to concessions electricity in 2000</p> <p>-Basic community health centers rate of coverage for the population: 82.9%</p> <p>-School enrolment rate:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◆ 98.9% (first cycle)</li> <li>◆ 33.1% (2<sup>nd</sup> cycle)</li> <li>◆ 0.7% of the population has higher education</li> </ul> <p>55% of the population under 20 years old</p> <p>-Literacy rate: 18% (2000)</p> <p>-Active population (excluding agricultural sector): <b>74% of which 24% female and 76% male</b></p> <p>-Population working in formal sector: <b>36%</b> (in 1989) compared with 64% in the informal sector</p> <p>-19.3% of population undertakes a commercial activity compared with 37.6% in services sector.</p> <p>-39% of the population lived in precarious neighborhoods in 1993</p> <p>-39% of the population lived in precarious neighborhoods in 1993</p>
-----------------------------	--

(1) in 2000

### 3.2 The District of Bamako in the National Context

The District of Bamako covers an area of 18,000 hectares. This total can be increased to 27,600 hectares if one includes 9,600 hectares of the area covered by the river that crosses the country and gives it its distinctive mark. It comprises 60 neighborhoods and 6 communes grouped around a District commune with 23 municipal councilors. The table below (Table 2) indicates the administrative framework (sharing of responsibilities) of the District.

**Table 2: City Administrative Framework**

<b>STATUS OF DISTRICT COMMUNES</b>	<b>FUNCTIONS OF THE DISTRICT</b>	<b>DISTRICT MUNICIPAL SERVICES</b>
<p>-The Communes do not as yet have they have adequate services</p> <p>-The communes are not yet organized.</p> <p>- The communes are for the</p>	<p>-Development Programmes and projects of the District Community</p> <p>-Budget and accounts of the District</p> <p>-Development and Urban Planning</p> <p>-Environmental protection</p> <p>-Construction and</p>	<p>- (Urban Environmental Protection Brigade (BUPE)</p> <p>-Traffic Regulation and Urban Transport Brigade (BRCTU)</p> <p>-Commune Support Unit of the District</p> <p>-Urban Roads and Sanitation Directorate (DSUVA)</p> <p>-District Markets of the District (RAMD)</p>

moment assisted by State services.	maintenance of roads whose maintenance is entrusted to the District -Acceptance and refusal of gifts and donations -Creation and method of management of personalized services and organizations of the District, management of the staff -management of public and private estates -Construction and maintenance of social amenities: secondary schools and training institutes, museums, hospitals -Determination of taxes and levies, institution of remunerative taxes -Cooperation and remuneration with other municipalities -Regulation of police administration -Naming of classified roads -Loans or loan guarantees -Formulation of development programmes	-Twinning Permanent Secretariat -Data Processing Unit -Multi-purpose Cartography (CARPOL) -District Estate Center (CDD) -Directorate of Cartography and Topography (DCT) -Tax collection -Housing Unit
------------------------------------	--	--

The city of Bamako was founded in the 17<sup>th</sup> century by a hunter. The beginning of the modern city dates from the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century with the establishment of a colonial administration. As the main town of Upper Niger in 1899, the city acquired the status of a mixed commune managed by a mayor-administrator in December 1918. In August 1978, an ordinance raised it to the rank of a district, a decentralized community with a rank of a region, with a legal entity and financial autonomy.

### 3.3. Economic Challenges Facing the Country

- Control over high population growth in an unbalanced **socioeconomic area** that benefits the Bamako District:
  - 24% of GDP;
  - 45% of national imports;
  - 25% of national consumption;
  - 45% of fixed capital formation;
  - 70% of commercial activities;
  - 68% of industries;
  - 70% of international trade.

- Population growth and the weak technical capacities in farming and agro-pastoral activities constitute a threat for the fragile economic balance of the Sahelian ecosystems and foster the advancement of the desert.
- The fight against the remoteness of economic regions and distance from the coast which constitutes an economic burden for a population that is traditionally made up of traders and a challenge to be overcome.

### **3.4. Other Basic Data on the Functioning of the District of Bamako**

#### **- The strategic challenges of the development of the District of Bamako**

The main challenge is that of sustainable urban development of the District in view of the poverty indicators highlighted above and the need to eliminate them. The lack of adequate development particularly calls for considerable efforts in the area of sanitation and the strengthening of a national tradition already established in combating social exclusion (every October). Lastly, support to citizen initiatives by women, and main development actors should be given a pride of place in meeting future challenges. The outcome of the strategic planning workshop will provide a much wider view of the long-term strategic development challenges of the District of Bamako.

## **IV- DESCRIPTION OF THE CONDUCTING OF THE PROCESS**

### **4.1. Activities identified for the ALPHALOG mission and status as at 12 October 2001**

The execution of the mission was programmed in 4 stages (cf. report by Rakotomalala Joseph Pascal and APPESSIKA Kouamé of 13 December 2000):

- City strategic analysis ;
- Thematic committee working group;
- Public day;
- Strategic planning workshop.

The activities were conducted according to the plan. Table 3 provides an overall view of the activities.

**Table 3: Initial Planning of Activities Programmed and Status of Implementation as at 12 October 2001**

ACTIVITY	PERIOD INITIALLY SET	EXPECTED RESULTS	DATE OF TRANSMISSION	PERIOD AND PLACE OF ACTIVITY	DATE OF PRODUCTION OF REPORTS
City strategic analysis	-	Provisional report	15 December 2000	December 2000 to June 2001 ALPHALOG	June 2001
Thematic committee working group	-	Committee report	20 December 2000	16 and 17 January 2001 CRES	February 2001
Public day	26-27 December 2000	Report	5 January 2001	8 February 2001 Congress Palace	February 2001
Strategic					

planning workshop	23-30 January 2001	Report	To be determined	13 to 16 February 2001 Modibo Kéita Memorial	Uncompleted report (1)
-------------------	--------------------	--------	------------------	---	------------------------

(1) A provisional report is available on the workshop, the methodology used, the themes of the workshop, but the final document on strategic options and areas is not yet ready.

## 4.2. Process Evaluation

The process was evaluated on the basis of documents provided and the findings of the meetings with representatives of the stakeholders: urban administration, civil society, private sector and business groups, upper echelons of the administration and international organizations. This evaluation has been organized according to the orientations of the terms of reference and highlights the following aspects for each stage: participation, priority issues, methodology used to achieve a consensus, mainstreaming of gender and poverty issues, achievements and problems. The results are presented in the form of summary tables:

- Priority issues according to various phases of the process
- Evaluation of the participation of various phases of the process
- Strength and weaknesses identified in the process.

Table 4: PRIORITY THEMES ACCORDING TO VARIOUS PHASES OF PROCESS

CITY STRATEGIC ANALYSIS	WORK GROUP SESSIONS	PUBLIC DAY PHASE	STRATEGIC PLANNING WORKSHOP PHASE
<b>Major Themes</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Urban and regional context</li> <li>• Urban poverty and quality of life</li> <li>• Social integration</li> <li>• Urban management</li> <li>• Regional / Urban Economy</li> <li>• Relationships of District with outside world</li> </ul>	<b>Major Themes</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Land use planning and land ownership aspects</li> <li>• Land use, infrastructure and social infrastructure</li> <li>• Economic development and mobilization of local resources</li> <li>• Social development and security</li> <li>• Cultural development, sport and leisure</li> <li>• Environment and living conditions</li> <li>• Institutional development and governance</li> </ul>	<b>Major Themes</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Land issues and development of city</li> <li>• Urban social services</li> <li>• Urban network services</li> <li>• Development and economic services</li> <li>• Environment, living conditions, sport, culture and leisure</li> <li>• Municipal administration and security</li> </ul>	<b>Major themes</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Urban economy</li> <li>• Local governance</li> <li>• Quality of life and environment</li> <li>• Education</li> <li>• Culture and leisure</li> <li>• Urbanization</li> </ul>
<b>Justification of themes</b> Conform to terms of reference	<b>Justification of themes</b> Conform to terms of reference	<b>Justification of themes</b> Without terms of reference on the conducting of the public day, the themes were chosen by the coordination body (ALPHALOG) and the technical steering committee of the District City Hall.	<b>Justification of themes</b> Choice and supervision by resource persons of BNEDT in collaboration with ALPHALOG
<b>Methodology</b> Study based on the collection and processing of available data by ALPHALOG. No precise reference framework in the identification of basic data for a study with a future dimension (DELPHI method; structural analysis; strategic analytical matrix) Emphasis on identification of strengths and weaknesses .	<b>Method of consensus building</b> Note distributed to moderators based on UMP guidelines (terms of reference).  Consensus found following long discussions led by resource persons from high echelons of the administration or private sector whose experience and competence are proven. Cross-fertilization of viewpoints made possible by the multiple disciplinary nature of the composition of the committees. The brainstorming session made for the expression of a wide range of views by the participants (an idea per card) leading to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-key ideas ;</li> <li>-a synthesis</li> </ul>	<b>Method for consensus building</b> Effort to involve stakeholders in decisions concerning the city. Modalities for these efforts were introduced by the Mayor himself who wished to know: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-the problems confronting the citizens and to which solutions had not been found.</li> <li>-the main constraints and manifestation of problems.</li> <li>- Approaches by District and partners to find concrete solutions .</li> </ul> Consensus found following long discussions led by resource persons from high echelons of the administration or private sector. Participation appreciated by the most disadvantaged sections of the population.	<b>Method for consensus building</b> Supervision by BNEDT <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-definition of a shared vision</li> <li>-Identification of overall and specific objectives</li> <li>-Definition of expected results by theme</li> <li>-Identification of activities by theme</li> <li>-Definition of implementation strategies</li> </ul>





**Table 5: EVALUATION OF PARTICIPATION IN THE DIFERENT PHASES OF THE PROCESS**

ANALYTICAL PHASE	GROUP WORK	PUBLIC DAY PHASE	STRATEGIC PLANNING WORKSHOP
<b>Urban administration and high echelons of the administration</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>District of Bamako leadership role of the technical steering committee and mayors (management of communication with the administration and other stakeholders)</li> <li>Collaboration from Directorate of National Statistics</li> <li>Key contribution by Mr. Zié Ibrahima, Secretary General of the Ministry of Town Planning and Regional Land Use and the Environment: provision of studies undertaken in the entire country.</li> </ul>	<b>Urban administration and high echelons of the administration</b> <b>52 participants</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>District of Bamako leadership role of the technical steering committee and mayors (management of communication with the administration and other stakeholders)</li> <li>Active Participation of 3 out of 6 town halls</li> <li>Involvement of other administration officials in the workshops (cf. list of participants in annexe).</li> </ul>	<b>Urban administration and high echelons of the administration</b> <b>Over 200 participants</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>District of Bamako leadership role of the technical steering committee and mayors (management of communication with the administration and other stakeholders)</li> <li>Involvement of other administration officials in the workshops (cf. list of participants in annexe)</li> </ul>	<b>Urban administration and high echelons of the administration</b> <b>About 60 participants</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>District of Bamako leadership role of the technical steering committee and mayors (management of communication with the administration and other stakeholders)</li> <li>Involvement of other administration officials in the workshops (cf. list of participants in annexe).</li> </ul>
<b>Civil Society</b>  Marginal role	<b>Civil Society</b>  Participation active	<b>Civil society</b> Work groups VI and VII included a significant number of representatives of the most disadvantaged sections of the population who also provided solutions to problems affecting development, environmental and living conditions.	<b>Civil Society</b>  Active Involvement
<b>Private Sector</b>  Marginal role	<b>Private sector and business</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Chamber of Agriculture and Trades</li> <li>Association of Surveyors</li> <li>Association of Architects</li> <li>Association of Engineers</li> <li>Real Estate Promotion</li> <li>Chamber of Commerce and Industry</li> <li>Association of Consumers</li> </ul>	<b>Private sector and business</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Contributions in all the working groups</li> </ul>	<b>Private sector and business</b>  Active involvement

**Table 6: STRENGTHS AND WEAKNESSES IN THE CONDUCTING OF THE PROCESS BY PHASE**

ANALYTICAL PHASE	GROUP WORK	PUBLIC DAY PHASE	STRATEGIC PLANNING PHASE
<b>Achievements</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Enhancement of knowledge of city</li> <li>Application of the results of a previous study already available undertaken by Governmental Structures on the future of the city i.e. the 18-month interim study on the District of Bamako.</li> <li>Highlighting of the major developmental problems of the city and the scale of problems to be addressed to promote sustainable human development</li> </ul>	<b>Achievements</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Synergy established between the study coordination unit of the study, the technical steering committee, government officials and economic operators of private</li> <li>High level of debates</li> <li>For a first experience, participants motivated</li> <li>Moral support by the representatives of international organizations.</li> </ul>	<b>Achievements</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>High public participation (over 200 participants)</li> <li>Socio-professional diversity of participants</li> <li>High involvement of most disadvantaged population</li> <li>Importance of testimonies by most disadvantaged on personal experiences</li> <li>Effectiveness of a local language as means of communication</li> <li>Role of moderators in the management of a forum that was difficult to control</li> </ul>	<b>Achievements</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Quality of stakeholder participation (district officials).</li> <li>Involvement of various high-level public and local administrations.</li> </ul>
<b>Drawbacks</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weak statistical base; discontinuous statistical series; lack of rigorous socio-demographic data that includes households as survey units</li> <li>Poverty indicators of the city hard to quantify</li> <li><b>Figures presented only have an indicative value on the overall characteristics of general poverty.</b></li> </ul>	<b>Drawbacks</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Problems of communication: some communes of the District could not fully participate in the sessions at the beginning.</li> </ul>	<b>Drawbacks</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Difficulties encountered in the management of number of participants</li> <li>Problems of space availability to organize group sessions</li> <li>No prior guidelines for organizing work sessions</li> <li>Problems of time management; a single day was inadequate to organize sessions for such a large group including many illiterates.</li> </ul>	<b>Drawbacks</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Time too short</li> <li>Strategic planning methodology insufficiently mastered by ALPHALOG despite initiation sessions by BNETD.</li> <li>Financial resources not obtained for the finalization of the strategic planning workshop.</li> </ul>

## CONCLUSIONS ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROCESS

- **Level of participation and effectiveness of local institutions**

The District city hall played the leadership role expected of it in mobilizing stakeholders. The technical aspects were conducted by the technical steering committee of the strategic development plan of the District: relations and collaboration with ALPHALOG; relations with other higher echelons of the administration; mobilization of all sections of the civil society.

- **Collaboration between local partner institutions**

Contacts made indicate that the various echelons of the central and local administrations were jointly involved in this project from which they expected positive spillovers at the end of the donor round table meeting. There was a clear awareness of the seriousness of the problems posed and the challenges at all levels of the administration as well as inadequate resources to face them.

- **Groups that contributed the most to the process**

The participation was at various levels of specialization: local institutions, higher echelons of the administration and specialized professional groups during the work group sessions and formulation of strategies; high participation of the civil society and all social classes in the public day.

- **Coordination of various groups**

ALPHALOG and the Technical Steering Committee of the District catered for this function. The results of the public day are the best indicator of the success with regard to the mobilization and involvement of social actors in making decisions for the future.

- **Mainstreaming of gender in the process**

There were no specific days devoted to women. Gender issues were incorporated into the general discussions on the poverty of disadvantaged groups (compare analytical study). On the other hand, the mobilization of women to participate in the sessions and the role of women leaders in such committees as well as neighbourhood women's associations indicate a high awareness by women of the role they can play themselves through their participation in finding solutions for their own problems and those of the society in general. We were struck by the importance of citizen initiatives by women and their wide understanding of developmental issues.

- **Collaboration between national and international partners**

The international organizations were informed about the implementation of the process. The World Bank and the UNDP followed the process without being directly involved. WHO and the World Bank were represented at the launch of the workshop technical committees. The international institutions are monitoring the process and are ready to examine the outputs depending on the relevance and realistic nature of the proposals relating to their specific areas of intervention.

- **Identification of priorities**

The priority identification phase was initiated but has not been sufficiently advanced in order to make for an accurate assessment. Delays were apparently due to financial problems that hindered the pursuit of the process. The table of the outputs of the study is still incomplete for the moment.

- **Obstacles and difficulties hindering the process**

The analytical phase was carried out from December to June. The results should have been available before the start of the committee work. The lack of adequate statistics and the time frame for preparing this document that served as an introduction to the process appeared to be the main causes of the delay. This aspect should be revisited if the experience were to be renewed for another city.

- **Factors contributing to the success of the various stages**

- The involvement of the city hall
- Availability of the secretariat of the technical steering committee despite an inadequate working environment
- Collaboration between ALPHALOG and this coordination committee does not appear to pose problems.

- **Negative perception of the CDS**

We consistently noted the following: there was no negative response, not even among the most informed interlocutors (officials of the administration and specialized professions). The hope placed in the project therefore appears to be a source of motivation for supporting the CDS.

## **5 OUTPUTS AND RESULTS OF CDS**

### **5.1.-Major elements of the vision**

- Bamako a prosperous city and city of interaction
- Bamako, a well-managed and safe city
- Bamako, a pleasant city
- Bamako city of culture
- Bamako, a modern city

### **5.2. -Options and orientations for strategic actions**

#### **- Option I:**

**Promote economic development through productive employment creation and resource mobilization activities**

#### **Strategic Areas**

- ⇒Organize and promote informal sector
- ⇒Rehabilitate, create and manage market facilities
- ⇒Improve resource mobilization
- ⇒Develop and implement an efficient artisanal policy
- ⇒Organize and promote the agro-food sub-sector

## **- Option II**

### **Improve local governance**

#### **Strategic Areas**

- ⇒ Promote spirit of citizenship
- ⇒ Ensure the security of persons and goods
- ⇒ Put in place a training programme
- ⇒ Define an internal and external communication policy
- ⇒ Encourage a better involvement and concentration of actors in decision making
- ⇒ Promote transparency in the management of local affairs
- ⇒ Revise instruments in general and particularly those on the special status of the District

## **- Option III**

### **Improve the quality of life of the population in healthy environment in 10 years**

#### **Strategic Areas**

- ⇒ Improve access by District communities to adequate means of transport
- ⇒ Improve urban environment
- ⇒ Render health services accessible to communities
- ⇒ Improve the socio-economic situation of the most disadvantaged sections of the population

## **• Option IV**

### **Have an efficient educational system**

#### **Strategic Areas**

- ⇒ Strengthen education
- ⇒ Improve quality of education
- ⇒ Promote school infrastructure and facilities
- ⇒ Strengthen literacy
- ⇒ Restore authority to schools
- ⇒ Strengthen partnership around schooling

## **• Option V**

**Make Bamako a city of culture, a city in which sport is seen as a factor for improving the quality of life and as a federating factor, a city that promotes physical, intellectual and psychological well being.**

#### **Strategic Area**

- ⇒ Develop our cultural wealth
- ⇒ Promote sports
- ⇒ Promote leisure and pastime activities

## **• Option VI**

### **Formulate and implement a suitable Urban policy**

## **Strategic Areas**

- ⇒ Improve infrastructure and equipment
- ⇒ Correctly manage land
- ⇒ Improve living conditions and access to decent housing in the District of Bamako
- ⇒ Enhance the transport and road traffic.

The document on the formulation of strategies was provided us only in the evening of 13 October and therefore we were unable to fulfil this aspect our mission. ALPHALOG is awaiting the provision of funds in order to complete this important component of the programme before the donors' meeting.

## **VI-A REVIEW OF THE CDS**

### **Were the objectives attained?**

- The objectives were attained with regard to the first three phases
- The production of the reports on the analytical studies suffered considerable delays
- **The workshop on the formulation of strategies took place. The long-term plan of action was also prepared. ALPHALOG is awaiting the payment of the second release of funds by the BNETD in order to finalize the investment programme, a key document for the organization of the donors' round table meeting.**
- The stakeholders have expressed their satisfaction with the CDS. This is particularly due to the fact that they took part in decisions about the future of their region.

### **Possible changes to be made if the process were to be repeated in another city**

- Adopt a more dynamic approach in processing information on database.
- Provide the Coordination with greater latitude for defining issues.
- It should be possible to use the reference framework of African Futures, FURURIBLES INTERNATIONAL and JOUVENEL for the regional studies by adapting them to realities.
- A social dialogue on a strategic analytical strategic matrix could be useful for introducing the notion of critical uncertainty in construction of scenarios leading to the formulation of a vision and strategies.

### **Analytical nature of the process**

In our humble view, the analytical report is not adequate enough for a study that constitutes the preparatory phase for a long-term study. The analysis needs to be enhanced and not consist in a mere compilation of data.

### **Capacities to be developed among the various partners to improve the process**

A brief initiation in “futures studies” and long term strategic planning  
A brief initiation in the analysis of the role of stakeholders  
A brief initiation in scenario methodologies and strategies

### **Recommendations suggested for another city**

A good understanding of the morphology of the city and the nature of urban sub-systems would be useful before and during sectoral analyses to guide the participants in the working groups and those for the public day.

**This latter aspect is essential, as it is also an important motivating factor among the communities. It would therefore be worthwhile extending it over at least two days in view of the large number of participants and the logistical and supervisory problems that affected the event.**

### **PROPOSALS**

- Many expectations, some of which were exaggerated were expressed during the public day. In order to keep the public regularly informed, we suggest that a project observatory be put in place. Its objective would be to assist the District to inform the various actors about the progress of the project with a view to averting some disappointments while still keeping the flame alive.
- The work environment of the technical steering committee seemed to be too constraining to enable it carry out this important task entrusted to it by the District. Support to UMP/BNETD is indispensable for the procurement of computer equipment and a photocopying machine.
- It is also essentially to strengthen the staff and put in place resource persons already earmarked (an economist and a specialist in communication).
- In view of the weak statistical base, it would be necessary to set up an observatory for the District for the production of indicators.

## ACRONYMS

ACVGMR	:	Association des victimes de l'incendie du Grand Marché
ADB	:	African Development Bank
AFD	:	Agence Française de Développement
BNETD	:	Bureau National des Etudes Techniques et de Développement
BRCTU	:	Brigade de Régulation de la Circulation et du Transport Urbain
BUPE	:	Brigade Urbaine de Protection de l'Environnement
CARPOL	:	Cartographie Polyvalente
CDP	:	Comité de Développement Participatif
CDS	:	City Development Strategy
DCT	:	Direction de la Cartographie et de la Topographie
DSUVA	:	Direction des Services Urbains de Voirie et d'Assainissement
GIE	:	Groupement d'Intérêt Economique
NGO	:	Non-Governmental Organization
RAMD	:	Régie Autonome des Marchés du District
UMP	:	Urban Management Programme
UNDP	:	United Nations Development Programme
WHO	:	World Health Organization



# ANNEXES

## ANNEX I : List of Persons Interviewed

NAME	STRUCTURE	FUNCTION
Seydou Diakité	ALPHALOG	National Coordinator of UMP project
Boukary Diarra	BAMAKO City hall	Civil engineer, secretary of the Steering Committee of the Bamako District Strategic Development Plan
Soungalo Koné	Bamako District	2 <sup>ème</sup> adjoint au maire
Mme Aminata Traoré M. Bélinka Simpara	Vegetables Market Main market	Chair, women's Association
Sékou Camara	Household Waste Collectors Association	Lawyer, out-going chairman
Jean-Baptiste Samaké	Regional Directorate of Youths and Sports, Arts and Culture et de la culture	Chief of Cultural Heritage Division
Mamadou Issa Tapo	Bamako District High Commission	Civil Administrator, Director of the Office of the High Commissioner
Yacouba Guindo	Association of Architects	Secretary-General
Makan Touré	Syndicat des transporteurs privés	Union Secretary General
Mme Dem Mariétou	Association of Consulting Engineers	Secretary General in charge of organization
Mme Maïga	WHO	Ingénieur des sciences de l'Environnement sanitary engineer
M. Touré	Traditional Leader	Retired philosophy teacher, Chief of Médina Koura neighborhood
Youssef Séga Konaté	National Directorate of Local Communities	Division chief of local elected officials
Mme Djénéba Camara	Mandé Development Association	Secretary at Women's Promotion department, General Secretary of the coordination of women of Commune IV
Aliou Coulibaly	Territorial Development Mission	Chief of the Implementation Unit
Seydou Mory Guindo	Territorial Development Mission	Chief of Territorial Development Mission
Cheik A. Traoré	World Bank	Infrastructures and Procurement
Mme Traoré Niakoro Damba	Women Coordinator Commune VI	Honorary President of Mousso Djigui, Deputy Secretary General of the Association of West African Women
Kalfa Sanogo	UNDP	Assistant to Resident Representative

## ANNEX II: Organizational diagram

